

## Lease Payments in “Perfect Market”

1) *If you buy an asset for \$100,000 today and sell it for \$30,000 in 7 years, what would you have to charge as a monthly lease rate in a perfect market? Interest rate is 6% with monthly compounding. Lease payments are made at the beginning of each month.*

## **Selling Price of Asset in “Perfect Market”**

*2) How much would you have to sell an asset for in 5 years in a perfect market if you buy it today for \$50,000 and lease it every 3 months for \$2,514 for 5 years? Interest rate is 8% compounded quarterly and the lease payments are made at the beginning of each quarter.*

### **Lease Timing Differences Part 1 (Straight Line Depreciation)**

3) *You are debating whether to buy or lease a machine. You can buy the machine for \$3.2 million. It will depreciate straight line for 4 years to a salvage value of zero. Alternatively, you can lease the machine for \$900,000 a year for 4 years. Lease payments are tax deductible and made at the beginning of each year. Tax rate is 40% and the discount rate is 7%. Should you lease or buy? What is the breakeven lease payment?*

## Lease Timing Differences Part 2 (CCA Depreciation)

4) *You are debating whether to buy or lease a machine. You can buy the machine for \$3.2 million. It will depreciate with a CCA rate of 20% for 4 years to a salvage value of zero. Alternatively, you can lease the machine for \$900,000 a year for 4 years. Lease payments are tax deductible and made at the beginning of each year. Tax rate is 40% and the discount rate is 7%. Should you lease or buy? What is the breakeven lease payment?*

### **Lease Timing Differences Part 3 (Range of Lease Payments)**

5) *A lessor buys a machine for \$120,000 and rents it out to a lessee for 4 years. The machine has a CCA rate of 100% and will have a salvage value of zero at the end of 4 years. The discount rate is 7%. The lessor and lessee have tax rates of 35% and 10% respectively. Lease payments are tax deductible and made at the beginning of each year.*

*a) What range of lease payments will make the transaction profitable for both parties?*

*b) At the lessee's break even lease payment, what will be the gain to the lessor?*

*c) At the lessor's break even lease payment, what will be the gain to the lessee?*

## Solutions

1) \$1166.77

2) \$11,992

3) *Net Advantage to Leasing* = - \$43,617.47 therefore buy. (see excel sheet)

INPUTS			Year 0	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4
		<b>Leasing</b>					
Lease Payment	\$900,000.00	Lease Payment	-\$900,000.00	-\$900,000.00	-\$900,000.00	-\$900,000.00	
		Tax Shield		\$360,000.00	\$360,000.00	\$360,000.00	\$360,000.00
Capital Expenditure	\$3,200,000.00	<b>Total Leasing Cash Flow</b>	<b>-\$900,000.00</b>	<b>-\$540,000.00</b>	<b>-\$540,000.00</b>	<b>-\$540,000.00</b>	<b>\$360,000.00</b>
		<b>Buying</b>					
Salvage Value	\$0.00	Capital Expenditure	-\$3,200,000.00				
Tax Rate	40%	Depreciation Tax Shield		\$320,000.00	\$320,000.00	\$320,000.00	\$320,000.00
		Salvage Value					\$0.00
Discount Rate	7%	<b>Total Buying Cash Flow</b>	<b>-\$3,200,000.00</b>	<b>\$320,000.00</b>	<b>\$320,000.00</b>	<b>\$320,000.00</b>	<b>\$320,000.00</b>
<b>Net Advantage to Leasing Cash Flows</b>			\$2,300,000.00	-\$860,000.00	-\$860,000.00	-\$860,000.00	\$40,000.00
<b>Net Advantage to Leasing PV Cash Flows</b>			\$2,300,000.00	-\$825,335.89	-\$792,068.99	-\$760,142.99	\$33,930.41
<b>Net Advantage to Leasing</b>			<b>-\$43,617.47</b>				

*Break even lease payment* = \$881,194.91 (see excel sheet)

INPUTS			Year 0	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4
		<b>Leasing</b>					
Lease Payment	\$881,194.91	Lease Payment	-\$881,194.91	-\$881,194.91	-\$881,194.91	-\$881,194.91	
		Tax Shield		\$352,477.96	\$352,477.96	\$352,477.96	\$352,477.96
Capital Expenditure	\$3,200,000.00	<b>Total Leasing Cash Flow</b>	<b>-\$881,194.91</b>	<b>-\$528,716.95</b>	<b>-\$528,716.95</b>	<b>-\$528,716.95</b>	<b>\$352,477.96</b>
		<b>Buying</b>					
Salvage Value	\$0.00	Capital Expenditure	-\$3,200,000.00				
Tax Rate	40%	Depreciation Tax Shield		\$320,000.00	\$320,000.00	\$320,000.00	\$320,000.00
		Salvage Value					\$0.00
Discount Rate	7%	<b>Total Buying Cash Flow</b>	<b>-\$3,200,000.00</b>	<b>\$320,000.00</b>	<b>\$320,000.00</b>	<b>\$320,000.00</b>	<b>\$320,000.00</b>
<b>Net Advantage to Leasing Cash Flows</b>			\$2,318,805.09	-\$848,716.95	-\$848,716.95	-\$848,716.95	\$32,477.96
<b>Net Advantage to Leasing PV Cash Flows</b>			\$2,318,805.09	-\$814,507.63	-\$781,677.18	-\$750,170.04	\$27,549.77
<b>Net Advantage to Leasing</b>			<b>\$0.00</b>				

4) *Net Advantage to Leasing = \$9,296.50 therefore lease. (see excel sheet)*

INPUTS			Year 0	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5
		<b>Leasing</b>						
Lease Payment	\$900,000.00	Lease Payment	-\$900,000.00	-\$900,000.00	-\$900,000.00	-\$900,000.00		
		Tax Shield		\$360,000.00	\$360,000.00	\$360,000.00	\$360,000.00	
Capital Expenditure	\$3,200,000.00	<b>Total Leasing Cash Flow</b>	<b>-\$900,000.00</b>	<b>-\$540,000.00</b>	<b>-\$540,000.00</b>	<b>-\$540,000.00</b>	<b>\$360,000.00</b>	
		<b>Buying</b>						
Salvage Value	\$0.00	Capital Expenditure	-\$3,200,000.00					
Tax Rate	40%	Depreciation Tax Shield		\$128,000.00	\$230,400.00	\$184,320.00	\$147,456.00	\$589,824.00
		Salvage Value					\$0.00	
Discount Rate	7%	<b>Total Buying Cash Flow</b>	<b>-\$3,200,000.00</b>	<b>\$128,000.00</b>	<b>\$230,400.00</b>	<b>\$184,320.00</b>	<b>\$147,456.00</b>	<b>\$589,824.00</b>
CCA Rate	20%	<b>Net Advantage to Leasing Cash Flows</b>	\$2,300,000.00	-\$668,000.00	-\$770,400.00	-\$724,320.00	\$212,544.00	-\$589,824.00
		<b>Net Advantage to Leasing PV Cash Flows</b>	\$2,300,000.00	-\$641,074.86	-\$709,546.46	-\$640,217.17	\$180,292.63	-\$480,157.64
		<b>Net Advantage to Leasing</b>	<b>\$9,296.50</b>					
		<b>CCA Schedule</b>						
		Year	UCC (beginning)	CCA	UCC (end)	CCA Tax Shield		
		1	\$3,200,000.00	\$320,000.00	\$2,880,000.00	\$128,000.00		
		2	\$2,880,000.00	\$576,000.00	\$2,304,000.00	\$230,400.00		
		3	\$2,304,000.00	\$460,800.00	\$1,843,200.00	\$184,320.00		
		4	\$1,843,200.00	\$368,640.00	\$1,474,560.00	\$147,456.00		

*Break even lease payment = \$904,008.06 (see excel sheet)*

INPUTS			Year 0	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5
		<b>Leasing</b>						
Lease Payment	\$904,008.06	Lease Payment	-\$904,008.06	-\$904,008.06	-\$904,008.06	-\$904,008.06		
		Tax Shield		\$361,603.22	\$361,603.22	\$361,603.22	\$361,603.22	
Capital Expenditure	\$3,200,000.00	<b>Total Leasing Cash Flow</b>	<b>-\$904,008.06</b>	<b>-\$542,404.84</b>	<b>-\$542,404.84</b>	<b>-\$542,404.84</b>	<b>\$361,603.22</b>	
		<b>Buying</b>						
Salvage Value	\$0.00	Capital Expenditure	-\$3,200,000.00					
Tax Rate	40%	Depreciation Tax Shield		\$128,000.00	\$230,400.00	\$184,320.00	\$147,456.00	\$589,824.00
		Salvage Value					\$0.00	
Discount Rate	7%	<b>Total Buying Cash Flow</b>	<b>-\$3,200,000.00</b>	<b>\$128,000.00</b>	<b>\$230,400.00</b>	<b>\$184,320.00</b>	<b>\$147,456.00</b>	<b>\$589,824.00</b>
CCA Rate	20%	<b>Net Advantage to Leasing Cash Flows</b>	\$2,295,991.94	-\$670,404.84	-\$772,804.84	-\$726,724.84	\$214,147.22	-\$589,824.00
		<b>Net Advantage to Leasing PV Cash Flows</b>	\$2,295,991.94	-\$643,382.76	-\$711,761.34	-\$642,342.78	\$181,652.58	-\$480,157.64
		<b>Net Advantage to Leasing</b>	<b>\$0.00</b>					
		<b>CCA Schedule</b>						
		Year	UCC (beginning)	CCA	UCC (end)	CCA Tax Shield		
		1	\$3,200,000.00	\$320,000.00	\$2,880,000.00	\$128,000.00		
		2	\$2,880,000.00	\$576,000.00	\$2,304,000.00	\$230,400.00		
		3	\$2,304,000.00	\$460,800.00	\$1,843,200.00	\$184,320.00		
		4	\$1,843,200.00	\$368,640.00	\$1,474,560.00	\$147,456.00		

5a) lease payments between \$32,381.72 and \$32,903.56 (see excel sheet)

### Lessor breakeven

INPUTS			Year 0	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4
		<b>Leasing</b>					
Lease Payment	\$32,381.72	Lease Payment	-\$32,381.72	-\$32,381.72	-\$32,381.72	-\$32,381.72	
		Tax Shield		\$11,333.60	\$11,333.60	\$11,333.60	\$11,333.60
Capital Expenditure	\$120,000.00	<b>Total Leasing Cash Flow</b>	<b>-\$32,381.72</b>	<b>-\$21,048.12</b>	<b>-\$21,048.12</b>	<b>-\$21,048.12</b>	<b>\$11,333.60</b>
		<b>Buying</b>					
Salvage Value	\$0.00	Capital Expenditure	-\$120,000.00				
Tax Rate	35%	Depreciation Tax Shield		\$21,000.00	\$21,000.00	\$0.00	\$0.00
		Salvage Value					\$0.00
Discount Rate	7%	<b>Total Buying Cash Flow</b>	<b>-\$120,000.00</b>	<b>\$21,000.00</b>	<b>\$21,000.00</b>	<b>\$0.00</b>	<b>\$0.00</b>
CCA Rate	100%	<b>Net Advantage to Leasing Cash Flows</b>	\$87,618.28	-\$42,048.12	-\$42,048.12	-\$21,048.12	\$11,333.60
		<b>Net Advantage to Leasing PV Cash Flows</b>	\$87,618.28	-\$40,218.19	-\$38,467.90	-\$18,417.94	\$9,485.75
		<b>Net Advantage to Leasing</b>	<b>\$0.00</b>				
		<b>CCA Schedule</b>					
		Year	UCC (beginning)	CCA	UCC (end)	CCA Tax Shield	
		1	\$120,000.00	\$60,000.00	\$60,000.00	\$21,000.00	
		2	\$60,000.00	\$60,000.00	\$0.00	\$21,000.00	
		3	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	
		4	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	

### Lessee breakeven

INPUTS			Year 0	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4
		<b>Leasing</b>					
Lease Payment	\$32,903.56	Lease Payment	-\$32,903.56	-\$32,903.56	-\$32,903.56	-\$32,903.56	
		Tax Shield		\$3,290.36	\$3,290.36	\$3,290.36	\$3,290.36
Capital Expenditure	\$120,000.00	<b>Total Leasing Cash Flow</b>	<b>-\$32,903.56</b>	<b>-\$29,613.20</b>	<b>-\$29,613.20</b>	<b>-\$29,613.20</b>	<b>\$3,290.36</b>
		<b>Buying</b>					
Salvage Value	\$0.00	Capital Expenditure	-\$120,000.00				
Tax Rate	10%	Depreciation Tax Shield		\$6,000.00	\$6,000.00	\$0.00	\$0.00
		Salvage Value					\$0.00
Discount Rate	7%	<b>Total Buying Cash Flow</b>	<b>-\$120,000.00</b>	<b>\$6,000.00</b>	<b>\$6,000.00</b>	<b>\$0.00</b>	<b>\$0.00</b>
CCA Rate	100%	<b>Net Advantage to Leasing Cash Flows</b>	\$87,096.44	-\$35,613.20	-\$35,613.20	-\$29,613.20	\$3,290.36
		<b>Net Advantage to Leasing PV Cash Flows</b>	\$87,096.44	-\$33,502.54	-\$31,516.97	-\$24,653.90	\$2,576.97
		<b>Net Advantage to Leasing</b>	<b>\$0.00</b>				
		<b>CCA Schedule</b>					
		Year	UCC (beginning)	CCA	UCC (end)	CCA Tax Shield	
		1	\$120,000.00	\$60,000.00	\$60,000.00	\$6,000.00	
		2	\$60,000.00	\$60,000.00	\$0.00	\$6,000.00	
		3	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	
		4	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	



5b) at a lease payment of \$32,903.56, the lessee will break even and the lessor will gain \$1,300.54 (see excel sheet)

INPUTS			Year 0	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4
		<b>Leasing</b>					
Lease Payment	\$32,903.56	Lease Payment	-\$32,903.56	-\$32,903.56	-\$32,903.56	-\$32,903.56	
		Tax Shield		\$11,516.25	\$11,516.25	\$11,516.25	\$11,516.25
Capital Expenditure	\$120,000.00	<b>Total Leasing Cash Flow</b>	<b>-\$32,903.56</b>	<b>-\$21,387.31</b>	<b>-\$21,387.31</b>	<b>-\$21,387.31</b>	<b>\$11,516.25</b>
		<b>Buying</b>					
Salvage Value	\$0.00	Capital Expenditure	-\$120,000.00				
Tax Rate	35%	Depreciation Tax Shield		\$21,000.00	\$21,000.00	\$0.00	\$0.00
		Salvage Value					\$0.00
Discount Rate	7%	<b>Total Buying Cash Flow</b>	<b>-\$120,000.00</b>	<b>\$21,000.00</b>	<b>\$21,000.00</b>	<b>\$0.00</b>	<b>\$0.00</b>
CCA Rate	100%	<b>Net Advantage to Leasing Cash Flows</b>	\$87,096.44	-\$42,387.31	-\$42,387.31	-\$21,387.31	\$11,516.25
		<b>Net Advantage to Leasing PV Cash Flows</b>	\$87,096.44	-\$40,542.62	-\$38,778.22	-\$18,714.75	\$9,638.62
		<b>Net Advantage to Leasing</b>	<b>-\$1,300.54</b>				
		<b>CCA Schedule</b>					
		Year	UCC (beginning)	CCA	UCC (end)	CCA Tax Shield	
		1	\$120,000.00	\$60,000.00	\$60,000.00	\$21,000.00	
		2	\$60,000.00	\$60,000.00	\$0.00	\$21,000.00	
		3	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	
		4	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	

5c) at a lease payment of \$32,381.72, the lessor will break even and the lessee will gain \$1,729.43 (see excel sheet)

INPUTS			Year 0	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4
		<b>Leasing</b>					
Lease Payment	\$32,381.72	Lease Payment	-\$32,381.72	-\$32,381.72	-\$32,381.72	-\$32,381.72	
		Tax Shield		\$3,238.17	\$3,238.17	\$3,238.17	\$3,238.17
Capital Expenditure	\$120,000.00	<b>Total Leasing Cash Flow</b>	<b>-\$32,381.72</b>	<b>-\$29,143.55</b>	<b>-\$29,143.55</b>	<b>-\$29,143.55</b>	<b>\$3,238.17</b>
		<b>Buying</b>					
Salvage Value	\$0.00	Capital Expenditure	-\$120,000.00				
Tax Rate	10%	Depreciation Tax Shield		\$6,000.00	\$6,000.00	\$0.00	\$0.00
		Salvage Value					\$0.00
Discount Rate	7%	<b>Total Buying Cash Flow</b>	<b>-\$120,000.00</b>	<b>\$6,000.00</b>	<b>\$6,000.00</b>	<b>\$0.00</b>	<b>\$0.00</b>
CCA Rate	100%	<b>Net Advantage to Leasing Cash Flows</b>	\$87,618.28	-\$35,143.55	-\$35,143.55	-\$29,143.55	\$3,238.17
		<b>Net Advantage to Leasing PV Cash Flows</b>	\$87,618.28	-\$33,060.72	-\$31,101.34	-\$24,262.90	\$2,536.10
		<b>Net Advantage to Leasing</b>	<b>\$1,729.43</b>				
		<b>CCA Schedule</b>					
		Year	UCC (beginning)	CCA	UCC (end)	CCA Tax Shield	
		1	\$120,000.00	\$60,000.00	\$60,000.00	\$6,000.00	
		2	\$60,000.00	\$60,000.00	\$0.00	\$6,000.00	
		3	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	
		4	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	