

LYTHE YESHIVA PIRCHEI SHOSHANIM SHULCHAN ARUCH LEARNING PROJECT

# **Hilchos Shabbos**

## **Volume One Lesson Three**

---



**Revised and edited by: Rabbi Leibie Landsman**

©Yeshiva Pirchei Shoshanim Inc. - Revised 2014

This shiur may not be reproduced in any form without permission of the copyright holder

---

## *Food Burning on the Stove*



*Siman 253:3-5*

*Food atop an empty pot*

*Pouring water into food on the fire*

*Part I*

*Siman 253 Se'if 3*

**3 If one rises early** (on Shabbos morning) **and finds that the food in his pot is beginning to burn, if he is concerned that it might burn, he may remove it, place a used empty pot on the mouth of the Kirah, and then put the pot containing the food atop the empty pot. One should be careful not to place the pot (containing the food) on the ground and it should be boiling hot.** *(It has already been stated that it is customary to be lenient (and permit returning a pot to a stove) even where it has been placed on the ground).*

*Siman 253 Se'if 4*

**4 One should protest against those whose practice it is to wrap up a kettle of hot water while still day** (on Erev Shabbos), **and then pour it into a pot of food on Shabbos when the food begins to dry out** *(see below Siman 318).*

*Siman 253 Se'if 5*

**5 On Shabbos, it is permissible to place onto a pot of hot water, a dish of food that is already fully cooked such as Panades<sup>1</sup> or the like, in order to warm it, since he is not he is not cooking in a usual manner. However it is definitely forbidden to place (food) under cloths that cover a water kettle.**

---

<sup>1</sup> A sort of *knish*, *borekas* - without any liquid

RAMA similarly it is forbidden to place (food) on a Kirah even if it is Gerufa and Ketuma, 2 as the sages only permitted Chazora 3 (but not placing a pot for the first time), as has been explained above. Some (authorities) permit placing (a pot of food) into a Tanur 4 used for baking on Erev Shabbos, when no food was left warming in it (it was merely used for baking on Erev Shabbos), only a small amount of heat remains and there need be no concern that this will cause it (the pot) to be cooked – provided (the food) has not cooled completely. Some, however, are stringent here, and (hold that) if the heat of the Tanur is so intense that it is of Yad soledes bo, 5 it is forbidden. See below Siman 318. One may not tell an Aino Yebudi 6 to do anything that is forbidden to do himself. It is therefore forbidden to tell an Aino Yebudi to heat up the pot (of food) that has cooled. If one does so, it is assur to eat it even cold. However, if the food has not cooled below the temperature at which it is edible, it may be eaten if the non-Jew heats it up. For this reason it is common practice to have non-Jews remove pots of food from ovens in which they have been stored to retain their heat, and place them next to or on top of a heating stove, and then have the (non-Jewish) maidservant light the stove, whereupon the food will become boiling hot once again. However it is forbidden to do this through a Jew. If, however, the pots are still hot they may be placed next to the heating stove. The reason is that, as has been explained, our ovens have a status of a Kirah, and placing it next to a Kirah, which is not Garuf Ve'katum, has the same law as placing directly on top of it when it is Garuf Ve'katum (which is muter). It has already been stated that the customary practice is to be lenient (and permit) to do Chazora even if the pot has been placed on the ground. Similarly, placing (a pot) next to an oven, which is not Garuf Ve'katum (is muter) if the food is still hot and fully cooked. It is a widespread, accepted practice to permit this. See below Siman 318.

---

**SIMAN 253:3**

---

## Placing Food onto a Pot

This *se'if* is based on the laws of Chazora in *se'if* 2. The innovation of this *se'if* is that placing an empty pot on top of an uncovered Kirah, gives the Kirah a status of Gerufa and Ketuma, to allow Chazora on Shabbos.

The remainder of the *se'if* follows the usual guidelines for Chazora.

According to the *Mechaber*, once the Kirah is covered with a pot one may do Chazora as long as the pot of food was not placed on the ground, the food is fully cooked and the food remains at Yad soledes.<sup>7</sup> The *Mishnah Berura* 83 says that our *Minhag* is

---

<sup>2</sup> The coals have been raked or covered with ashes

<sup>3</sup> Returning a pot to a stove

<sup>4</sup> See beginning of *Shiur* 3

<sup>5</sup> Literally meaning the hand retracts from the heat – too hot to touch, the degree where food begins to cook.

<sup>6</sup> *Aino Yebudi* – a non-Jew

<sup>7</sup> As mentioned often before – the temperature at which food is considered boiling

to be lenient, as long as the food is still warm, it may be returned to the covered *Kirah*, even though it is not *Yad soledes bo*.

The *Rama* mentions a custom that one may return food to the *Blech* even if it was placed onto the floor. This custom is based on the *Ran* who holds that the laws of *Chazora* apply only to food removed before Shabbos and returned on Shabbos.

According to applied *Halacha*<sup>8</sup> we are *machmir*<sup>9</sup> and only allow *Chazora* when the food was not placed onto the ground on Shabbos (if all the other conditions mentioned in *se'if* 2 are met).

### The Blech Fell Off

In this *se'if* we learn that one is permitted even to place a *Blech*<sup>10</sup> onto open flames on Shabbos; surely then if the *Blech* falls off, it may be also be returned to the fire.

Some “stovetop covers” are made from thin metal and when placed onto a fire they turn red hot. Such a *Blech* or cover may not be placed onto the fire because it involves the *Melacha* of *מבעיר*/*Ma'ir* – making a fire.

**For advanced study: The Chazon Ish has a concern with the issue of annealing a חצי שיעור. This issue can be found in the Shemiras Shabbos Ke'hilchasa 1:18 footnote 60. Rav Shlomo Zalman Auerbach argues there with the Chazon Ish.**

Another important topic regards placing food *lechatchila*<sup>11</sup> on top of another pot on Shabbos. This will be discussed in *se'if* 5.

## SIMAN 253:4

## Pouring Water

The *Nimukei Yosef*<sup>12</sup> in *Bava Basra 10a* quotes *Rabbeinu Yona* who says that people who pour water, which was stored in a kettle before Shabbos into food that is drying out, are

<sup>8</sup> See *M"B* 67

<sup>9</sup> Stringent

<sup>10</sup> A metal sheet used to cover the flames

<sup>11</sup> For the first time, not only through *Chazora*

<sup>12</sup> Can be found at the back of the *Gemora* around the *Rif*

violating the Shabbos when the food is *Yad soledes* and the water is not. By reheating the cooled water to more than *Yad soledes*, one is doing *Bishul*.<sup>13</sup>

The problem here happened because the water was just wrapped up and lost its heat. If, however, the water was also on a *Blech* or hotplate – retaining the same heat as the food, there would be no problem as both pots would be above *Yad soledes* and one may pour the water into the pot.

*Rabbeinu Yona* in his sefer *Aliyos de'Rabbeinu Yona* <sup>14</sup> (*Bava Basra 19a*) presents a different reason for the above prohibition. He states that even if both foods (the water and food) are *Yad soledes*, nevertheless according to an opinion in the Talmud Yerushalmi “*Trui lan ke'Keli Rishon*” i.e. the liquid poured from a *Keli Rishon* (the pot on the fire) does not retain the status of that *Keli Rishon* once poured out of the *Keli Rishon*. Therefore, it is *assur* to mix it into the food in the pot on the fire because it gets cooked again.

According to this reason, not only is it *assur* to pour water stored in a flask etc. from before Shabbos into the pot of food, it is even *assur* to pour water that is cooking on the fire into the food.

---

**SIMAN 253:4**  
**CONTINUED**

---

## Which Reason Did the Mechaber Use?

### First School of thought:

*Taz* (17), *Magen Avraham* 32), *M”B* 84 and many others say that the *Mechaber*’s source is the first reason, since they all explain the *Mechaber*’s reason for the *issur* being that the food on the stove is *Yad soledes* and the stored water might not be *Yad soledes*. Accordingly, one may pour hot water that is on the fire into another pot that is on the fire. (We are discussing only the issue of pouring water. Other issues such as closing the lid, stirring and food fully cooked are not discussed here).

### Second School of thought:

*Harav Ovadia Yosef* (*Yechaveh Da’as* 4-22) learns that the *Mechaber* used the second reason of *Rabbeinu Yonah* too. Therefore, he prohibits pouring water from the kettle even if on the fire, into a pot of food that is on the fire.

*Harav Bentzion Abba Shaul* (*Ohr Le’tzion B*, 17-8) says *lema’aseh* one should be *machmir* (stringent) and not pour water from the kettle that is on the fire into a pot of food.

---

<sup>13</sup> Cooking – one of the 39 *Melachos* of Shabbos. Reheating *be’issur* will be discussed in greater detail in *Siman 318*

<sup>14</sup> *Rabbeinu Yona* was also quoted by the *Chidushei HaRan Shabbos 47b* and other *Meforshim*.

However, he says, there are those which are *meikel* (lenient) and do pour the hot water into a pot of food, and they have whom to rely upon.

### Halacha Lema'aseh According to the Mechaber

1. To pour from stored water into a pot on the fire is forbidden.
2. To pour from a kettle which is on the fire, into another pot that is on the fire; there are many who understand that the *Mechaber* permits it.

*Rav Ovadia Yosef* forbids it and *Rav Bentzion Abba Shaul* says that one who is *meikel* has whom to rely on. One should therefore ask one's *Rav* which opinion to follow.

## Pouring Hot Water into a Pot – On/Off Fire

### Mechaber

The *Mechaber* holds, according to some opinions, once the food or liquid is in a *Keli Sheini*, it loses its identity of a cooked food and when reheated in a *Keli Rishon* <sup>15</sup> it is cooking again. Therefore, to pour the water from the thermos flask – a *Keli Sheini*, into the pot of food – a *Keli Rishon*, the water cooks, and it is forbidden to do so.

### Rama

The *Rama* is **not** bothered by the fact that the water is in a *Keli Sheini* and then poured into a *Keli Rishon*, because if the water is still warm it is not considered cooking. In this case, all the other conditions of *Chazora* do not have to be met, because the water is not being placed into a pot on the fire, rather into a *Keli Rishon* off the fire.

### According to the Rama

The *Magen Avraham* <sup>32</sup> says that in accordance with our *Minhag* to allow *Chazora* of food that is still warm, even if less than *Yad soledes bo*; it may be poured into a hot pot of food. The *Mishnah Berura* <sup>84</sup> supports this *Halacha*.

## There are 5 situations where the Rama's leniency can possibly be applied

**Case #1: When pouring hot/warm water stored<sup>16</sup> in the original kettle that it was heated in – Keli Rishon - before Shabbos, into a pot of food on the stove.**

<sup>15</sup> The original pot where the food was cooked.

<sup>16</sup> Stored – refers to hot water wrapped in a container to retain its heat (*Hatmanah*)

**Requirements Needed to Allow Chazora (for water stored in Hatmanah)**

- A. The water was removed from the fire with the intention of being returned to the fire (albeit to another pot).
- B. It was not continually held in one's hand, but it must not have been placed on the floor.
- C. It must still be hot or at least warm.
- D. The water was fully cooked.
- E. The fire must be covered with a *Blech* (i.e. *Garuf Ve'katum*).

Therefore, if the stored water was put onto the floor,<sup>17</sup> one may not do *Chazora*. The *Rama* at the end of the *se'if* reiterates the *Minhag* of people was to be lenient even if it was put onto the ground. As discussed, one should not follow this *Minhag* unless by accident it was (at least) placed onto a chair or countertop.

**Case #2: When pouring water directly from a kettle that is on the fire into a pot of food that is on the stove.**

Even if the water is not *Yad soledes bo*, since it is was on the fire and it is still warm, it is *muter* to pour the water from the kettle into the food.

Nevertheless, one must take care that the spout of the kettle or urn is not held too close to the pot of food, because the steam rising from the usually 'meaty' *Cholent*, can make the kettle meaty.

Also, if it comes down into the pot of food on the fire with a force it is an issue of *Meigis* – stirring, which we are *machmir* not to do, like the opinion of the *Kolbo* in *Siman 318:18*

**Using a Cup or Ladle**

In the *Shemiras Shabbos Ke'Hilchasa*,<sup>18</sup> Rav Shlomo Zalman Auerbach זצ"ל is quoted that it is *muter* to use a cup or ladle to transfer the water from the urn to the pot of food.

---

<sup>17</sup> It appears that while it's in the *Hatmanah*, it's not considered as being on the floor.

<sup>18</sup> *SS"K* chapter 1 footnote 44 and the 3<sup>rd</sup> volume (תיקונים ומילואים) 1<sup>st</sup> chapter annotation 44. The *SS"K* (two volumes) was written by Rav Neuvirt *sblit"a* and it includes many *halachos* from Rav Shlomo Zalman Auerbach זצ"ל. Prior to his passing he reviewed everything quoted in his name and his new annotations were compiled into the "3<sup>rd</sup>" volume, the תיקונים ומילואים.

His son, *HaRav* Shmuel Auerbach *shlit"a*,<sup>19</sup> says the reason it is *muter* to use a cup is because the cup acts like a bridge, and is not considered as being placed into another vessel. He thereby avoids the problem of *Pina mi'meicham le'meicham*.

**Case #3: When pouring water from a thermos flask – Keli Sheini - into a pot of food on the stove.**

In order to understand this case well, we must introduce a new concept, as follows:

**Pina Mi'meicham Le'meicham<sup>20</sup>**

The *Gemora* in *Shabbos 38b*, where it discusses different laws of *Chazora*, asks what would be the law if one removed a pot of food from the fire, transferred the food to another pot, and wishes to return the *new* pot of food to the fire.

*Rashi*<sup>21</sup> explains the point of doubt to be that we know that *Chazora* is allowed, not putting the food on Shabbos onto the fire for the first time.

Therefore, when one returns the same pot of food to the fire (where all the conditions of *Chazora* are met) it is viewed as *Chazora*. But when one transfers the food to another pot and places the *new* pot with the *old* food onto the fire, it looks like he's placing it there for the first time. The *Gemora* leaves this question unanswered.

**What is the Halacha in this Matter?**

The *Magen Avraham 20* says that the *Rama*, who holds that one of the conditions of *Chazora* is that the food must be continually held in one's hand, prohibits doing *Chazora* if the food was transferred to another pot.

The *Shulchan Aruch HaRav 14* also holds like the *Magen Avraham* and forbids *Chazora* if the food was transferred to another pot.

However, the *Mishnah Berura* in *Sha'ar Hatziyun 47* says that one can be *meikel* - lenient, and do *Chazora* even if the food was transferred to another pot.

In Case #3 the water was stored in a thermos flask, which is a new pot, not the utensil the water was heated in. Therefore, if one wants to add water from the thermos into the pot of food that is on the stove, the issue of *Pina mi'meicham le'meicham* exists.

---

<sup>19</sup> He wrote about this topic in his approbation to *sefer Megillas Sefer* written by one of his disciples.

<sup>20</sup> Meaning – food emptied or poured from one pot to another

<sup>21</sup> *Rashi* beginning with the word: *Pinan etc.*



**Therefore:**

According to the *Magen Avraham* and the *Shulchan Aruch HaRav*, it is forbidden to add the water to the pot of food, as that water comes from a *new* pot, and is viewed as placing for the first time, not *Chazora*.

**However,**

Even according to the *M"B*, who is *meikel* in the law of *Pina mi'meicham le'meicham*, it is *assur*, because placing the water in a flask is worse than placing the food onto the floor – as it is a completely eliminating the food from the fire. Even if one has intention to return it to the fire, it will not help (*Rav Shlomo Zalman Auerbach*<sup>22</sup>).

**Case #4: When pouring boiling water from a kettle that is on the fire, into a plate that has food and liquid in it.**

We will learn *be"H* in *Siman 318* that there is no *issur* to reheat cold cooked dry food. However, there is an *issur* to reheat cold cooked liquids:

- 1) According to the *Mechaber* if cooled below *Yad soledes*
- 2) According the *Rama* if no longer warm

**WHEN ONE POURS BOILING WATER FROM THE KETTLE THAT WAS ON THE FIRE ONTO COLD LIQUIDS OR FOODS WHICH CONTAIN LIQUIDS AND ARE IN A PLATE OR BOWL, THEN...**

**ACCORDING TO THE MECHABER...**

If the liquids are less than *Yad soledes*, it is forbidden, because the boiling water reheats the liquid.

**ACCORDING TO THE RAMA...**

If the liquids are still warm, it is *muter*. Since the liquids are still warm from its *Bishul* – cooking, no new cooking takes place since the effect of the first *Bishul* is still present. However, once they have cooled, it is forbidden, because the boiling water cooks the liquids.

However, the *Mishnah Berura* 84 (also *Sha'ar Ha'tziyun* 79) quotes the *Magen Avraham* 32 saying that it is preferable to use a ladle to pour the water onto the liquid that is in the plate, rather than pouring directly onto it. By using a ladle, the food or liquid in the ladle

---

<sup>22</sup> פניני המאור ח"ג מב-א.

(in some cases<sup>23</sup>) becomes a *Keli Sheini* and when poured onto the liquid in the plate, it does not cook it.<sup>24</sup>

The *Mishnah Berura* adds that if the liquid in the plate has cooled down, a ladle must be used according to all opinions. Therefore, when taking a second helping of soup, one must take care not to transgress *Bishul*.

**Case #5: When pouring water from a thermos flask into a pot of food that was removed from the fire.**

**Machlokes Mechaber and Rama**

Since a thermos flask is considered a *Keli Sheini*<sup>25</sup>, it would be *assur* according to the *Mechaber* to pour it into a pot that was removed from the stove, since that is a *Keli Rishon*. In this case, the *Rama* would allow it, since the water is still warm.

**Pouring Water into a Pot on the Stovetop**

The *Beis Yosef* cites a *Kol bo* saying that there is an issue of *Hagasah*<sup>26</sup> – stirring or mixing, when pouring the water into the pot. It is noteworthy to mention that *Rav Shlomo Zalman Auerbach* wrote<sup>27</sup> that if one pours the water gently into the pot, there should be no problem of *Meigis* – stirring, and this our *Minhag*.

**Placing a Cover onto a Pot on the Stove**

Placing a cover onto a pot of fully cooked food, in certain instances, can have the same effect as *Meigis* because it quickens the cooking process.

*HaRav Moshe Sternbuch shlit'a* (*Teshuvos Ve'hanhagos* 1-27) and other *Poskim* are *meikel* regarding placing the cover back onto the pot. *Harav Ezeriel Auerbach shlit'a* also agrees that it is *Muter* to cover the pot.

---

<sup>23</sup> If the ladle is not left inside the pot where the ladle will get very hot and be considered like a *Keli Rishon* – see *M"B* 318: 43.

<sup>24</sup> The reason is that *Iru Keli Sheini ke'Keli Shlishi* – that pouring from a second vessel has the status of the third vessel, which does not cook (*M"A* 447:9). A *Keli Sheini* also is not considered cooking. Still, an uncooked food should not be placed into a hot *Keli Sheini* because it's *מחזי כמשל* *M"B* 318:34.

<sup>25</sup> Second vessel. Food or liquid poured from the cooking pot into another vessel, bowl, plate etc.

<sup>26</sup> The problem is that by stirring the food one quickens the cooking process, and even if the food is fully cooked, the *Kolbo* was *machmir* and said food should not be stirred. The debate is whether pouring has the effect of stirring or only whether one might come to stir.

<sup>27</sup> *תיקונים ומילואים פ"א הערה מב*

*Iggros Moshe* (Vol. 4, 74-10) maintains that one should leave the lid semi-closed and then add water. He says that if one totally uncovered the pot, one should be *machmir* not to cover it again while it's on the stove.

The *Sefer Shemiras Shabbos Ke'Hilchasa* says<sup>28</sup> that *lechatchila*, one should not cover the pot when it is on the fire even when the food is fully cooked. It should be lifted, covered and returned to the fire. However, if the fire is not covered and due to that he will not be able to return the pot to the stove, one can rely upon the lenient opinion and cover the food when on the stove.<sup>29</sup>

---

**SIMAN 253:5**

## *Placing One Pot onto Another*

### *Part I*

#### TOPICS IN THIS SE'IF

1. Placing pots on top of other pots
2. If an *Aino Yehudi* warmed food for a Jew
3. Warming food on a heating stove

The *Ran* in *Shabbos* 19a<sup>30</sup> teaches us that it is *muter* to place a cold pot of cooked dry food on top of another pot that is on the fire, even without adhering to any of the laws of *Chazora*. This pertains even to foods taken from the refrigerator.

However, this does not apply to liquids. We will learn in *Siman 318*, in detail, that soups or foods with gravy are *assur* to reheat above *Yad soledes* except when the laws of *Chazora* are kept.

The *Mechaber's* example of *Panades* is an example of a food that may be reheated since it is like a meat knish which doesn't have any liquid gravy.<sup>31</sup>

---

<sup>28</sup> SS"K chapter 1 footnote 94

<sup>29</sup> This matter will be discussed later in *Siman 318*

<sup>30</sup> In the *Rif's* numbering

<sup>31</sup> M"B 86

The reason why the usual conditions of *Chazora* do not apply here is because this is not the usual manner of cooking, so we don't perceive him as cooking something from anew (See *M"A* 33).

#### CONTRADICTION

Many *Poskim* point out that *se'if 3* and *se'if 5* seem to contradict each other.

In *se'if 3* the *Mechaber* says that if the food is drying out, one may take a dry empty pot, place it on the fire and then place the pot of food on top of it, emphasizing that the pot of food must not be placed on the floor.

In *se'if 5* it says that one may take a pot of food that was cooked on *Erev Shabbos* and place it on top of a pot of food that is presently cooking on the fire, even though the *new* pot is cold or it was not on the fire.

#### THREE WAYS TO RESOLVE CONTRADICTION

##### **Magen Avraham**

The *Magen Avraham* in *Siman 318:26* explains the *Mechaber* that *se'if 3* refers to soups or foods with liquid, and it is *muter* to place it onto another pot because it was already on the fire and he is just doing *Chazora*.<sup>32</sup> If it was not on the fire until now, it is *assur* to place it onto another pot even if the liquid is warm or even hot.

*Se'if 5* that allows it to be placed onto the pot even when it wasn't on a fire refers to dry foods that may be placed on top of another pot even if it's cold.<sup>33</sup>

Accordingly, it is *muter* to place any type of dry food onto pots that are on the stove.

The *M"A* himself disagrees with the *Mechaber's psak* and *paskens* that it is *muter* to place warm liquids onto other pots on the fire even when they have not been on the fire until now.

##### **Dagul Me'revava** <sup>34</sup>

The *Dagul Me'revava* draws on the *Ran* to answer this contradiction.

The above-mentioned *Ran* says that food such as *Panades*, may be placed directly on a *Kirah* on Shabbos (as long as it is *Mitztamek ve'ra lo*<sup>35</sup>) because everyone can see

<sup>32</sup> According to this, it's irrelevant whether the pot that is on the fire has food in it or not

<sup>33</sup> This explanation of the *M"A* is according to the understanding of the *Tosefos Shabbos*

<sup>34</sup> The famous *Rav Yechezkel Landau zt"l* of Prague, author of the *Noda Be'Yehuda*. The *Dagul Me'revava's* annotations can be found in the margin of our edition of the *Shulchan Aruch*.

<sup>35</sup> Hardening to its detriment

that the intention is to reheat the *Panades* and not to cook it, since the common cooking method for *Panades* is *inside* an oven, not *on top* of a stove.

Therefore, the *Dagul Me'revava* concludes that in *se'if 5* we are referring particularly to foods such as *Panades*, which according to the *Ran* may be placed directly onto a stove. However, in *se'if 3* the *Mechaber* refers to foods that are commonly cooked *on top* of a stove. Those types of foods may only be *returned* to the fire, not placed there for the first time since otherwise it gives the impression he maybe cooking it for the first time.

Accordingly it is *assur* to place onto pots that are on the stove, even dry foods, if they are the type which commonly cooked *on top* of a stove.

### Pri Megadim

The *Pri Megadim* offers a more simple and straightforward solution. *Se'if 5* refers to placing a pot onto a **pot that has food inside it** which is on the fire. Since placing a pot of food on top of another pot with food inside is not the common method of cooking, there is no cause for concern that it looks like he's cooking food. *Se'if 3* refers to placing an empty pot onto the flame to cover it. This looks more like the common manner of cooking since sometimes people cover a fire to cook food on the cover, giving the impression that he may be cooking on Shabbos.

The *Chazon Ish*<sup>36</sup> explains the *Pri Megadim* as follows: when the bottom utensil is full, it absorbs the primary heat and the pot above is not considered on the fire, but when the bottom utensil is empty, the heat rises almost entirely to the full pot, and is considered as being directly on the fire.

The *Bi'ur Halacha*<sup>37</sup> commends the *Pri Megadim* solution, and goes on to explain why he prefers the *Pri Megadim's* solution over the solution of the *Dagul Me'revava*. Since the *Mechaber* disagrees with this *Ran*, it's obvious that he would not use the *Ran* as the basis to allow putting food directly on the stove. Rather there must be a different explanation to explain the contradiction between the two *se'ifim*.

According to the *Pri Megadim*, one may put any dry food onto another pot of food that is on the fire, not only oven baked *Panades* types. They must however be dry and fully cooked foods.

<sup>36</sup> *Simon 37* at the end of *se'if 9*

<sup>37</sup> In *se'if 3* opening with the words: ויזהר שלא.

### Halacha Le'ma'aseh

We follow the *psak* of the *Bi'ur Halacha*. Therefore, one may put any dry, fully cooked food on top of another pot of food that is on the fire, even cold from the refrigerator. If it's a wet food (**דבר לח**), and it's still warm (according to the *Rama* or hot according to the *Mechaber*), he may also put it onto another pot that's on the fire.

## Placing Previously Cooked Food onto an Inverted Pot over a Blech

### QUESTION

If one doesn't have a pot of food presently cooking on the fire, may he place an empty pot or tin upside down over the *Blech* or hotplate and place a dry, cold pot of food on top? <sup>38</sup>

### ANSWER

We just mentioned that according to the *Pri Megadim*, an empty pot placed onto a fire makes the stove *Garuf Ve'katum*, and one may only **return** food (*Chazora*) to the stove but not place cold food there. Then why should placing an empty inverted pot on the *Blech* make it any better?

An argument can be made to justify using an inverted pot over a *Blech*. The difference is that placing a cold pot of food onto a pot of food cooking on the fire is *mutter* because it is not the usual way of cooking, so it's perceived that he is just warming previously cooked food and not cooking anew. So too, by inverting an empty pot on a *Blech* or hotplate and using the top warm cold food is also not the usual way of cooking. Therefore, it too is perceived as warming and not cooking.

This is the *psak* of Rav S. Z. Auerbach – See *Shemiras Shabbos Ke'hilchasa* (Vol. 3 fn. 112), and HaRav Shmuel HaLevi Vozner (Vol. 1 *Siman* 91). It is important to note that not all *Poskim* agree to this leniency. One should consult with a *Rav* before using this leniency.

## Summary

- A *Blech* may be placed on a fire even on Shabbos. It can also be replaced in the event that it falls off.

---

<sup>38</sup> E.g. *Kugel*, pie or knish

- According to the *Mishnah Berura*, one is allowed to transfer the contents from one pot into another provided the conditions of *Chazora* are met. Therefore, it is *muter* to pour hot water from a kettle (*Keli Rishon*) into Cholent that is burning on the stove if those conditions are met. One may even use a cup as a medium.
- The water should be poured gently to avoid issues of *Hagasah*. However, if the water is coming from a thermos (*Keli Sheini*) it is forbidden because of *Pina mi'mecham le'mecham*.
- According to the *Rama*, liquids that were cooked may be reheated as long as they have not cooled completely. It would follow that one may pour hot water directly from a *Keli Rishon* onto **warm** liquids. Nevertheless, the *M"B* advises to be stringent and to use a ladle. When pouring onto cool liquids one must use a ladle according to all opinions.
- Some *Poskim* hold that covering a pot that is on the stove is forbidden because it is tantamount to *Hagasah*. Other *Poskim* permit it (this is only true when the food is fully cooked). *Lechatchila* one should do so when the food is off the fire.
- One may reheat food that is cold, dry and fully cooked on top of a pot of food that is on a fire. On top of an empty pot one needs the conditions of *Chazora*.

## Review Questions

1. May one return a *Blech* to the fire that fell off or moved out of place?
2. What are the problems of pouring water into a pot of food that is on the fire?
3. All the cases mentioned in the shiur are according to the *Rama*, why can they not be according to the *Mechaber*?
4. May one pour water from one pot on the fire to another?
5. When food is transferred to another pot, is it more reason to permit *Chazora* or less reason?
6. What is the Halacha in a case of *Pina mi'mecham le'mecham*, may one do *Chazora*?
7. May one pour soup from the pot onto cooked rice, cold gravy, a piece of chicken?
8. May one pour a cold, cooked liquid into a *Keli Rishon* that is not on the fire (return cold soup to the hot pot of soup)?
9. If the soup in a plate is *Yad soledes bo* may it be returned to the pot of soup off the fire?

10. What type of pots may be placed above a pot on the fire?
11. Why is the placing on top of another pot better than placing directly onto a *Blech*?
12. What is the apparent contradiction between *se'if 3* and *se'if 5*?
13. How is this contradiction resolved?
14. Is one permitted to place a pot of food (from the refrigerator) directly onto the *Blech* or hotplate?
15. How is one to heat food on Shabbos day?

## Review Answers

1. Yes, perfectly permissible. One must take care though that it is not made of a substance that will turn red hot when in contact with fire.
2. Two main problems. The stored water may have cooled down and when returned to the fire one is re-cooking the water. The other problem is that when poured from a *Keli Rishon* it loses its cooked status and is re-cooked when in the pot on the fire. There is another problem mentioned in *Siman 318* of *Meigis* – stirring the contents.
3. The *Mechaber* holds that one may not pour stored water into a pot. R' Yona holds that even pouring from water that is on the fire into another pot that is on the fire is a problem of *Bishul* because the water cools down upon leaving the pot. There are different views as to the opinion of the *Mechaber* (whether he rules like R' Yona, as mentioned in shiur 7) and therefore it is not simple that according to the *Mechaber* one may pour from a pot on the fire.
4. Yes one may, provided that the laws of *Chazora* are met, which in this case would mean that the fire is covered, the water is fully cooked and lechatchila the pot of water was not put down.
5. It is less reason to permit it because it does not look as if one is returning food to the fire, as this pot was not there previously.
6. The *Magen Avraham* and the *Shulchan Aruch HaRav* prohibit it; it appears from the *Sha'ar Hatziyun* to be permitted.
7. Pouring from a hot soup in a *Keli Rishon* is equivalent to cooking. Therefore one may pour hot soup onto dry cooked rice and a cold piece



of chicken because they are fully cooked and dry. One may not pour it onto cold gravy because gravy is a liquid and it re-cooks it.

8. Once the liquid has cooled down it may not be returned to a *Keli Rishon* that is *Yad soledes bo* even if it is not on the fire. If it is still warm, it may be returned according to the *Rama* but not according to the *Mechaber*.
9. According to the *Rama*, it may, as above. According to the *Mechaber* one may not because once outside a *Keli Rishon* it loses its cooked status and when placing it inside the pot it cooks again.
10. Only food that is fully cooked and solids. Liquids may not be placed on top of a pot if it can reach *Yad soledes bo*. This is based on *Siman 318*.
11. Placing on top of another pot is not the regular cooking method and therefore it acts as a reminder not to stoke the coals or raise the fire.
12. In *se'if 3* it says that one must not place the pot onto the floor before placing it above another pot on the fire, and in *se'if 5* it says that one may place a pot of food on top of another pot without stipulations.
13. There are several solutions. The *M" A* differentiates between liquids and solids. The *Dagul Me'revava* differentiates between foods cooked on a stove and foods cooked in an oven, based on the *Ran*. The *PM" G* differentiates between placing above a pot with food and an empty pot. The *Bi'ur Halacha* cites the *PM" G*.
14. We see from the *PM" G* that it is forbidden, if we take for granted that our hotplates are equivalent to a *Blech*. (There are *Poskim* who say that a hotplate is better than a *Blech* and one may place food directly onto it provided that there is no problem of *Bishul*. We will send an appendix addressing this issue).
15. Food that is not subject to the constraints of *Bishul* such as fully cooked dry foods may be placed onto a pot of food that is on the fire or on top of a water urn. Another option, according to some *Poskim*, is to place an upside baking tin onto the *Blech* or hotplate and place fully cooked solids on top of that.