The Puzzling Reunion of Yosef with his Brothers

Source 1: Bereishit Ch. 42

לשְבר בְתוֹךְ הַבָּאִים: כִּי-ָּנָעַן, הָּרָעָב, בָּאֵרֵץ כִּנָעַן.

ל,באו בני ישראל, 5 And the sons of Israel came to buy among those that came; for the famine was in the land of Canaan.

ויוסף, הוא השליט על-ָהָאָרֶץ--הוּא הַמַּשְׁבִּיר, לְכָל-עַם הָאָרֶץ ; וַיָּבאוּ אֲחֵי יוֹסֵף, וַיִּשְׁתַּחַווּ-לוֹ אַפַּיִם אַרְצָה. faces to the earth.

6 And Joseph was the governor over the land; he it was that sold to all the people of the land. And Joseph's brethren came, and bowed down to him with their

It could be that Yosef had direct oversight of anyone coming from outside of Mizraim

- o Was he waiting for Yaakov's sons to arrive?
- o Did he know that they would come?
- o Did he plan his strategy in advance, in accordance with his childhood dreams?

Source 2: Bereishit Ch. 42: 8-9

אֲשֶׁר חָלַם לָהֶם...

אָתִינו אַתִינו And Yosef knew his brothers, וֹהֶם לא הכּרָהוֹ : וַיּזְכּר but they did not know him. And יוֹסֵף אֶת הַחַלמוֹת Yosef remembered the dreams that he had dreamed about them...

So it seems that the memory of the dreams just came to him after the brothers arrived!

Source 3: Bereishit Ch. 37

-וַיּאמֶר, אֲלֵיהֶם: שִׁמְעוּ **1 6** And he said unto them: נא, הַחֲלוֹם הַזֶּה אֲשֶׁר 'Hear, I pray you, this

dream which I have dreamed:

וְהְנֵּה אֲנַחְנוּ מְאַלְמִים 7 for, behold, we were אַלְמִּים, בִּתוֹךְ הַשָּׁדֵה, וְהִנֵּה ָקָמָה אֲלֻמָּתִי, וְגַם-נִצְּבָה ; וְהגַה תְּסֻבֶּינָה אֲלֵמִתִיכֶם, וַתִּשִׁתַחוֵין לַאַלְמַתִי.

binding sheaves in the field, and, lo, my sheaf arose, and also stood upright; and, behold, your sheaves came round about, and bowed down to my sheaf.'

There is no mention of the number of sheaves bowing down to him; but the bowing down of the sheaves to Yosef's sheaves seem to be a playing out of the dependence that the brothers

will eventually have on Yosef. Submitting to Yosef in order to access wheat.

Source 4: Rashi

(ט) אשר חלם להם - עליהם, וידע שנתקיימו, שהרי השתחוו לו:

Ramban offered the same interpretation before he moved to Eretz Yisrael...

Source 5: Bereishit Ch. 43

לֵאמר: הָעֵד הֶעִד בָּנוּ הָאישׁ לאמר לא-תראו פַנֵי, בּלְתִי אַחיבֶם אתַכֶם.

, ויאמר אַליו יהוּדָה, 3 And Judah spoke unto him, saying: 'The man did earnestly forewarn us, saying: Ye shall not see my face, except your brother be with you.

אם-יֶשְׁךְ מְשַׁלֵחַ אֶת-אָחינוּ, **ז** 4 If thou wilt send our brother with

us, we will go down and buy thee food;

ה ואם-אינד משלח, לא ָנֵרֶד: כִּי-הָאִישׁ אָמַר אֱלֵינוּ, לא-תראו פָנֵי, בּלְתִּי, אֲחִיכֶם אתכם.

5 but if thou wilt not send him, we will not go down, for the man said unto us: Ye shall not see my face, except your brother be with you.'

What was Yosef's plan? When the brothers come a second time, together with Binyamin, such that they now number eleven, the second dream would be fulfilled - the dream of the sun and moon and eleven stars. Recall the original second dream:

Source 6: Bereishit 37:9

הְנָה חַלַמְתִּי חַלוֹם עוד, וְהַנֵּה הַשֶּׁמֶשׁ וְהַיָּרֵחַ וְאַחַד כּוֹכַבִים, מִשְׁתַּחֲוִים

עוד חַלוֹם אַחֵר, **ט** אַחֵר חַלוֹם אַחַל **9** And he dreamed yet another ַויִסַפֵּר אתו לְאֶחִיו; וַיּאמֵר, dream, and told it to his brethren, and said: 'Behold, I have dreamed yet a dream: and, behold, the sun and the moon and eleven stars bowed down to me.'

Source 7: Midrash Sechel Tov – Miketz 43:15

(טו) ויקחו האנשים את המנחה הזאת ומשנה כסף לקחו בידם. שמא הוקר השער כיש כסף המושב: ויקומו וירדו מצרים ויעמדו לפני יוסף. כפופין כעבד לפני רבו. ויש דורשין לשם גדולה, ויעמדו לפני יוסף בעינים גבוהות, זש"ה מתן אדם ירחיב לו ולפני גדולים ינחנו (משלי יח טז:)

Rav Yoel Bin Nun: But upon reaching Eretz Yisrael, Ramban suddenly confronted a great question. Having experienced at first hand the short distance between Egypt and Eretz Yisrael, he raised a problem that had not previously occurred to him:

Source 8: Ramban

כי יש לתמוה אחר שעמד יוסף But we have to ask, after Yosef had been in Egypt for many years, and held a senior position in the household of an important Egyptian nobleman – לא שלח כתב אחד לאביו להודיעו

ולנחמו, כי מצרים קרוב לחברון כששה ימים, ואילו היה מהלך שנה היה ראוי להודיעו לכבוד אביו, ויקר פדיון נפשו ויפדנו ברוב ממון how could he not have sent a note to his father, to inform him and to comfort him? For the distance from Egypt to Chevron is [a journey of] about six days; even if it were a journey of a year, it would have been proper for him to notify him, out of respect for his father, who would have paid a huge ransom to redeem him.

His answer to the question views Yosef's dream as a binding prophecy:

...אבל היה רואה [יוסף] כי השתחוויית אחיו לו וגם אביו וכל זרעו אתו, אי אפשר להיות בארצם, והיה מקווה להיותו שם במצרים בראותו הצלחתו הגדולה שם, וכל שכן אחרי ששמע חלום פרעה שנתברר לו כי יבאו כולם שמה ויתקיימו כל חלומותיו But [Yosef] saw that having his brothers prostrate themselves before him, along with his father and all of his descendants, could never happen while in their land. And so he awaited his arrival in Egypt, to behold his great prosperity there, and especially after he heard Pharaoh's dream, which made it clear to him that all of them would come there and all of his dreams would be fulfilled

Rav Bin Nun: At this point, Ramban changed his original commentary, now arguing that in the first visit to Egypt, the brothers should have numbered eleven, and therefore the first dream had not yet been fulfilled until they came a second time together with Binyamin. The second dream, which included the sun and moon and the stars, was fulfilled only when Yaakov came down to Egypt.

Ramban then adds:

ועל כן לא רצה להגיד להם אני יוסף אחיכם, ולאמר מהרו ועלו אל אבי וישלח העגלות עמהם עשה בפעם כאשר השניה, כי היה אביו בא מיד בלא ספק. ואחרי שנתקיים החלום הראשון הגיד להם לקיים החלום השני. **ולולי כן** היה יוסף חוטא חטא גדול לצער אביו ולהעמידו את ימים רבים בשכול ואבל על שמעון ועליו, ואף אם היה רצונו לצער את אחיו קצת איך לא יחמול על שיבת אביו, אבל את הכל עשה יפה בעתו לקיים החלומות כי ידע שיתקיימו

Therefore he did not wish to tell them, "I am Yosef, your brother," and to say, "Hurry and bring up my father," and to send wagons, as he did the second time, for his father would unquestionably have come right away. After the first dream had been fulfilled, he instructed them [so as] to fulfill the second dream. Were this not the case, Yosef would have been guilty of a grave transgression in causing anguish to his bringing father and prolonged bereavement and mourning upon him, for Shimon and for himself. Even if his intention would have been to cause some anguish to his brothers, how could he not show compassion to his elderly father? [Evidently, then,] he did all of this in the proper time, so as to bring his dreams to realization, for he had known that they would come true. (ibid.)

Source 9: Commentary of Abarbanel

באמת:

למה התנכר יוסף לאחיו ודיבר אתם קשות, והלוא היה זה עוון פלילי, בהיותו נוקם ונוטר כנחש... ואיך אם כן, העטופים ברעב, וחוץ מארצם בדרך רחוקה, ובניהם וטפם מייחלים להם, כל שכן אביו הזקן שבע רוגז Why did Yosef hide his identity from his brothers, and speak harshly to them? Was this not an unwarranted transgression, representing revenge and spite?... How, then, [could he treat in this way] these hungry people who had journeyed far from their country, while their children and babies were waiting for them, and especially his elderly

ומלא דאגות, איך לא חמל father, consumed with unhappiness and full of עליו והרבה צער על צערו worry? How could he not have compassion on במאסר שמעון!יי him, heaping additional anguish upon him by placing Shimon under arrest?

Source 10: Akeidat Yitzchak

תמהני ממה שכתב הרמב"ן י"ל שעשה כדי שיתקיימו חלומותיו, כי מה תועלת לו כשיתקיימו, ואף כי תהיה תועלת לו, לא היה לו לחטוא נגד אביו; והחלומות הנותן חלומות יגיש פתרונם! גם שתיראה סכלות עצומה שישתדל האדם לקיים חלומותיו, שהרי הם דברים אשר ייעשו שלא מדעת בעלים!

I wonder at Ramban's suggestion that [Yosef] acted in order to bring about the realization of his dreams. For of what benefit would it be to him if they were realized? And even if there was some benefit to him, he should not have sinned towards his father. As for the dreams, He Who gives dreams provides for their interpretation! It seems greatly foolish for a person to try to bring his dreams to realization, for they are things that happen without the subject's conscious choice!

Why did Yosef not reveal his identity after hearing his brothers' regret?

The alternative interpretation proposed by Abravanel and the Ba'al Ha-Akeida suggests that Yosef's strategy was aimed at ascertaining whether his brothers had repented. If they had not undergone a profound and thorough process of teshuva, Yosef would not be able to reveal his identity without reopening the old wound in Yaakov's household.

Source 11: Bereishit Ch. 42

ליקוּ מְכֵּם אֱחָד, וִיִּקַח אֵת־. 16 Send one of you, and let him fetch your אַחִיכֶם, וְאַתֵּם הֵאָסְרוּ, וִיבָּחֵנוּ brother, and ye shall be bound, that your דּבָרֵיכֵם הַאֵמֵת אִתִּכֵם; וְאִם-לא-- words may be proved, whether there be בי אַהָעה, פֿי מְרַגְּלִים אַתֶּם. truth in you; or else, as Pharaoh liveth, surely ye are spies.'

ר, שְׁלִשֵּת, שְׁלִּשֶׁר, שְׁלִשֵּת 17 And he put them all together into ward .מים three days.

הָאֱלֹהִים, אֲנִי יַבְא.

בּיּוֹם אַלֵהֶם יוֹסֵף בַּיּוֹם 18 And Joseph said unto them the third רשלישי, זאת עשו וחיו; אֶת- day. 'This do, and live; for I fear God:

יט אָם-כֵּנִים אַתֵּם--אֲחִיכֶם אֶחָד, **19** if ye be upright men, let one of your יָאָמֵר בְּבֵית מִשְׁמַרְכֶּם; וְאַתֵּם לְכוּ brethren be bound in your prison-house; ָהָבּיאוּ, שֵׁבֵר רַעֲבוֹן בָּתֵּיכֶם. but go ye, carry corn for the famine of your houses:

עָביאוּ אֵלַי, בּיאוּ אֵלַי, **בּיאוּ** אֵלַי, **20** and bring your youngest brother unto ; וְיֵאָמְנוּ דְּבְרֵיכֶם וְלֹא תָמוּתוּ me; so shall your words be verified, and ye .ויעשׂוּ-כן shall not die.' And they did so.

בא ויאמרו איש אֵל-אָחיו, אַבַל 21 And they said one to another: 'We אשמים אנחנו על-אחינו, אשר are verily guilty concerning our ָרָאִינוּ צַרַת נַפְשוֹ בְּהְתְחַנְנוּ אֵלֵינוּ, brother, in that we saw the distress of ולא שַמַענוּ; עַל-כֵּן בַּאַה אֵלְינוּ, his soul, when he besought us, and we . מְצָרָה הַזּאָת would not hear; therefore is this distress come upon us.'

בב ויַעַן רְאוֹבֵן אתָם לֵאמר, הַלוֹא 22 And Reuben answered them, saying: אמר אל-תֵחטאוי 'Spoke I not unto you, saying: Do not sin against the child; and ye would not הנה נדרש. hear? therefore also, behold, his blood is required.'

23 And they knew not that Joseph understood them; for the interpreter יוסף: כי המליץ, בינתם. was between them.

בד וישב מעליהם, ויַבד; ויַשב 24 And he turned himself about from them, and wept; and he returned to אֵלֶהֶם, וַיִּדְבֶּר אֵלֶהֶם, וַיִּקַח מֵאִתָּם אָת-שׁמְעוֹן, וַיַּאֱסר אתוֹ לְעֵינֵיהֶם. them, and spoke to them, and took Simeon from among them, and bound him before their eyes.

Source 12: Echoes of Ch. 37- Yosef arrives in Dotan:

יט ויאמרו, איש אל-אחיו: הנה, בַעל הַחֱלמות הַלַּזָה--בַּא.

19 And they said one to another: 'Behold, this dreamer cometh.

כ ועתה לכו ונהרגהו, ונשלכהו באחד הַברות, וִאָמַרִנוּ, חַיָּה רָעָה אֲכָלָתְהוּ; ונראה, מַה-יהיו חַלמתיו. 20 Come now therefore, and let us slay him, and cast him into one of the pits, and we will say: An evil beast hath devoured him; and we shall see what will become of his dreams.

ָכא וַיִּשְׁמַע רָאוּבֶן, וַיַּצְלֵחוּ מִיָּדָם; ַויאמֶר, לא נַכֵּנוּ נַפֶשׁ. 21 And Reuben heard it, and delivered him out of their hand; and said: 'Let us not take his life.

כב וַיּאמֶר אֱלֶהֶם רְאוּבֶן, אֱל-תִּשְׁפְּכוּ-דַם--הַשְּׁלִיכוּ אתוֹ אֵל-הַבּוֹר הַזֶּה אֲשֵׁר ָבַּמִדְבָּר, וְיָד אַל-תִּשְׁלְחוּ-בוֹ: לְמַעַן, הַצִּיל אתו מִיַדַם, לַהַשִּיבו, אֵל-אַבִיו.

22 And Reuben said unto them: 'Shed no blood; cast him into this pit that is in the wilderness, but lay no hand upon him'-that he might deliver him out of their hand, to restore him to his father.

ָכג וַיִּהָי, כַּאֲשֶׁר-בָּא יוֹסֵף אֱל-אֶחַיו; ַוַיַּפִשִּׁיטוּ אֵת-יוֹסֵף אֵת-כַּתָּנִתּוֹ, אֵת-בתנת הפסים אשר עליו. 23 And it came to pass, when Joseph was come unto his brethren, that they stripped Joseph of his coat, the coat of many colours that was on him;

כד וַיּקַחָהוּ--וַיַּשְלכוּ אתו, הַבּרָה; וָהַבּוֹר רָק, אֵין בּוֹ מַיִם.

24 and they took him, and cast him into the pit--and the pit was empty, there was no water in it.

Back to our current story.... Source 13a) Bereishit 42:24

בד וישב מעליהם, ויִבד; ויִשְׁב 24 And he turned himself about from them, and wept; and he returned to אֵלֶהֶם, וַיִּדַבֶּר אֲלֵהֶם, וַיִּקַח מאתם את-שמעון, ויַּאֱסר אתו them, and spoke to them, and took לְעֵינֵיהֶם. Simeon from among them, and bound him before their eyes.

Source 13b) Rashi

את שמעון - הוא השליכו לבור, הוא שאמר ללוי (לעיל לז יט) הנה בעל החלומות הלזה בא.

13c) Midrash Sechel Tov on Bereishit 37

יט) ויאמרו איש אל אחיו. שמעון אומר ללוי תחילה שהיו אחים כלי חמס, וכולם הסכימו להם, לכך כתיב ויאמרו:

13d) Targum Yonatan on Bereishit 37

(יט) ואמרו שמעון ולוי דהוו אחין בעיטתא גבר לאחוי הא מרי חלמיא דיכי : אתי

But, according to Abarbanel and Akeidat Yitzchak, Why did Yosef continue to hide his identity from his brothers, and why was no message sent to his father?

Source 14: Abarbanel:

הנה עם כל הניסיון שעשה בעלילת לאחיו יוסף המרגלים עוד נשאר ספק בליבו, האם היה להם אהבה עם בנימין, או אם היו עדיין שונאים את בני רחל אמו, ולכן רצה להביא את בנימין בפרט בניסיון הגביע, לראות אם ישתדלו להצילו ... ויהיו בעיני יוסף בעלי תשובה גמורים, ויתוודע אליהם. וייטיב עמהם כמו שעשה

Despite the whole test to which Yosef had subjected his brothers through accusation of spying, there still remained a question in his mind as to whether they felt love towards Binyamin, or whether they still hated the sons of Rachel, his mother. Therefore, he wanted to subject Binyamin specifically to the test of the goblet, to see whether they would exert themselves to save him... and Yosef would then consider them complete ba'alei teshuva (penitents), and he would make himself known to them and treat them well - as indeed he did.

What do you think of this explanation for Yosef's continued approach to his brothers?

Rav Bin Nun: Had Yosef wept and reunited with his brothers when they arrived with Binyamin, the story would have been quite simple. Both dreams had now been fulfilled, Yosef had heard his brothers' regret, he had set his eyes upon Binyamin, and the time would now have come to set aside his disguise and show his brothers that the ruler of Egypt was in fact the long-lost Yosef. This would have been the time to explain how the money had been returned to their sacks and how it was that he had been able to seat them at the meal in the proper order of their ages, to recount all that had happened to him during the intervening years, and also to hear what had happened to them.

But when the brothers present Binyamin, this is what happens:

Source 15: Bereishit Ch. 43

בט וַיִּשָא עֵינַיו, וַיַּרָא אֵת־ 29 And he lifted up his eyes, and saw בּנִימִין אַחִיו בֵּן-אִמּו, Benjamin his brother, his mother's ,ויאמר הַוֶּה אַחיכֶם הַקְּטן, son, and said: 'Is this your youngest ; אֲשֶׁר אֲמַרְתֶּם אֵלִי brother of whom ye spoke unto me?' ביי, אֵלהִים יָחְנְךְּ בְּנִי. And he said: 'God be gracious unto thee, my son.'

ל וַיְמַהֵר יוֹסֵף, כִּי-נִכְמִרוּ 30 And Joseph made haste; for his ָרַחֲמָיו אֶל-אָחִיו, וַיְבַקּשׁ, heart yearned toward his brother; and he sought where to weep; and he ַרַבְּךָ שָׁמָּה. entered into his chamber, and wept there.

It seems that the second dream is fulfilled...

בת וַיּאמְרוּ, שָׁלוֹם לְעַבְדְדְּ 28 And they said: 'Thy servant our father is well, he is yet alive.' And they bowed the head, and made obeisance.

וישתחו (וַיִּשְׁתַּחֲווּ).

Yosef then carries out the scheme with the goblet (which he places in Binyamin's sack)

Rav Bin Nun proposes that Yosef meant to keep Binyamin in Egypt and to disclose his identity to him alone. From what Binyamin would tell him, he would learn how matters stood between the sons of Leah and the sons of Rachel, and whether he could, at some future time, reestablish contact with his father.

Source 16: Yehuda's speech in Vayigash Bereishit 44

ַלַאמֹר: הְיֵנִשֹּ-לְּכֶים אָב, אוֹ-אח.

יט אַדני שָאַל, אֶת-עַבְדִיוּ 19 My lord asked his servants, saying: Have ye a father, or a brother?

נאמר, אל-אַדני, יש-לַנוּ בּ וַנּאמֶר, אָב זָקַן, וְיֶלֶד זְקַנִים קָטָן; וְאָחִיו מֵת, וַיִּנְתֵר הוּא לְבַדּוֹ לאמו ואביו אַהֶבו.

20 And we said unto my lord: We have a father, an old man, and a child of his old age, a little one; and his brother is dead, and he alone is left of his mother, and his father loveth him.

ָניאמֶר עַבְדְּדְּ אָבִי, אֵלֵינוּ : אַתֶּם יְדַעְתֶּם, כִּי שְנַיִם יַלדַה-לי אשתי.

27 And thy servant my father said unto us: Ye know that my wife bore me two sons;

נאבר, אַד טָרף טרף; ולא said: Surery inc is tolin in have not seen him since; ראיתיו, עד-הנה.

בת וַיִּצֵא הָאֶחָד, מֵאתִי, 28 and the one went out from me, and I said: Surely he is torn in pieces; and I

Reality check: WE know what happened, but Yosef not: This is the first time that Yosef has heard that his father believed that he was dead, mauled by a wild animal! Yosef had not known that his brothers slaughtered a wild goat and dipped his coat in its blood, so as to deceive their father. All he knows is that his beloved father sent him to where his brothers were shepherding, and when he reached them, they stripped him of his coat and threw him into a pit, following which he was sold and taken to Egypt.

Rav Bin Nun: For many long years, Yosef has been asking himself: Where is my father? Where are my brothers? How is it that no one has come looking for me all these years? Yosef has lived under the misunderstanding that he was sent away from his father's house (like Hagar and her son, and like the sons of Ketura) – either because the sons of Leah seized dominance, or because of a Divine command, as in the case of Hagar.

An answer to Ramban as to why Yosef never sent messengers to his father?

Source 17: Bereishit 45:8

וַישִימֵנִי לִאָב לְפַרְעה, וּלְאָדוֹן לְכָל-בֵּיתוֹ, וּמשׁלֹ, בְּכָל-אֶׁרֶץ

וועתה, לא-אַתֶּם שָׁלַחְתֵּם 8 So now it was not you that sent me ; אתי הַנָּה, כּי, הָאֱלהים hither, but God; and He hath made me a father to Pharaoh, and lord of all his house, and ruler over all the land of Egypt.

Source 18: Bereishit 50:20

; ןאַתֶּם, חֲשַׁבְתֶּם עָלַי רָעָה **20** And as for you, ye meant evil

against me; but God meant it for good, אֵלהים, חֲשָׁבָה לְטבָה, -עֶשה כַּיּוֹם הַגָּה, לְהַחְית עַם to bring to pass, as it is this day, to save much people alive.

Source 19: Bereishit Ch. 44

וְנַפְשוֹ, קשורה בְנַפְשוֹ.

ינבאי אֶל-עַבְדְּךְ **30** Now therefore when I come to thy servant my father, and the lad is not with us; seeing ; אָבי, וְהַנַּעַר, אֵינֶנוּ אִתְּנוּ that his soul is bound up with the lad's soul;

Source 20:

Following Yehuda's speech: Bereishit Ch. 45

ן להתאַפֵּק, לכל זוסף להתאַפֵּק, לכל זוסף להתאַפֵּק, לכל 1 Then Joseph could not refrain הוציאו הוציאו himself before all them that stood by יבל-איש מעלי; ולא-עמד איש him; and he cried: 'Cause every man . אָתוֹ, בָּהְתְוַדַע יוֹסֵף אֵל-אֵחֵיו. to go out from me.' And there stood

no man with him, while Joseph made himself known unto his brethren.

ניּתֵן אֶת-קלוֹ, בּבְכִי; וַיּשְמְעוֹ 2 And he wept aloud; and the .מצרים, וַיִּשִּׁמֵע בֵּית פַּרְעה Egyptians heard, and the house of Pharaoh heard.

Maybe this can give new meaning to Yosef's apparently unnecessary question:

ג וַיּאֹמֶר יוֹסֵף אֶל-אֶחָיו אֲנִי גַּנִי יְכְלוּ אֶחְיו לַעֲנוֹת אתוֹ, כּי were affrighted at his presence. נִבְהַלוּ מְפַּנֵיוּ.

3 And Joseph said unto his brethren: 'I am Joseph; doth my father yet live? And his יוֹסֵף, הַעוֹד אָבִי חִי ; וְלא- Josepn; dom my namer yet nive. אווי אָבִי חָי ; וְלא- brethren could not answer him; for they