The Heart Sutra:

**Exploring Wisdom Beyond Wisdom** Taught by Kazuaki Tanahashi Sensei and Joan Halifax Roshi

Talk One, Part 1: Encountering Enigma

**ROSHI:** We're taking a plunge into the jewel of the stream of the Mahayana—the Heart Sutra.

It's so wonderful that Sensei Kaz's book gathers many translations of the Heart Sutra together

and introduces us to not only the history of the Heart Sutra but also to its spirit. How wonderful.

I ask us as we begin to explore this enigma to keep the question alive within us: How do we

practice the Heart Sutra? How do we bring it in to our daily life? How do we actualize it in this

moment-to-moment mind in how we encounter each other and also how we encounter

ourselves, as well as how we encounter the world?

So, Kaz, thank you so much.

KAZ: Thank you. Good evening.

**GENERAL:** Good evening.

KAZ: Welcome. We are kind of making some double things. We have this Heart Sutra seminar

with you here, but also we're doing online course filming, so sometimes I address people who

are virtually here, and sometimes I ask you who are actually here.

This evening, I'd like to give a short introduction to the Heart Sutra, and I'll ask Roshi to

speak a little bit. Then I will give you some orientation on this seminar. It's sort of upside down,

but in a way I think it may work better. And then we do some rehearsing of chanting.

The Heart Sutra is the face of Mahayana Buddhism. It is the most widely chanted

scripture. Even today, this very day, millions and millions of people chant it with vigor. In a short

form, the sutra summarizes a selfless experience of reality in meditation and illustrates how this

selfless experience transcends our usual way of thinking and living.

There are two types of Heart Sutra: the shorter version and the longer and later version.

The shorter version is recited mostly in East Asia—namely, China, Korea, Japan, and Vietnam.

And the longer version has been mainly recited where Tibetan Buddhism is practiced—that is,

Tibet, Nepal, Bhutan, and Mongolia.

1

There are several versions of the Heart Sutra in Chinese, but the best known version is one by Xuanzang, a seventh-century Chinese monk who left his home country by himself, journeyed to India, studied Sanskrit and other Buddhist disciplines, and became a great debater in Sanskrit and brought a great number of Sanskrit scriptures to China. And he led a national translation project, translating from Sanskrit to Chinese. All the versions in the Western languages (such as English, German, French, Spanish, Russian) are all based on Xuanzang's seventh-century version.

There are common versions of the Heart Sutra, and also we have a new version. The common English version of the sutra says—this is the best-known passage of the Heart Sutra, you all know: "Form is emptiness. Emptiness is form." Emptiness is one of the central concepts of the Heart Sutra. We could say Mahayana Buddhism, without this sutra, is like breakfast without a bagel. [Laughter] And the Heart Sutra without emptiness is like a bagel without you know what. (I like to talk about bagels because I'm Jewish by marriage.) [Laughter]

Also, the common version of the Heart Sutra says, "No eye, no ear, no nose, no tongue, no body, no mind." Don't we get lost without eyes and nose? I think the Heart Sutra is a millennium-old enigma yet to be solved. So I'd like to ask all of you a question: How was your first encounter with the Heart Sutra? What was your attraction and what was puzzling about it? So please think about it. Maybe tomorrow morning, I'd like some of you to respond.

Roshi, would you like to say something?

**ROSHI:** So I wonder, do we have the copies of the old Heart Sutra and the translation? I think it would be wonderful to pass those out. In a way, the Heart Sutra is the expression of the mother of all Buddhas, and it is that experience that I encountered when I first chanted the Heart Sutra, which happened to have been in the Korean language. The first time I chanted the Heart Sutra in a sangha was in Korean. It was very vigorous, the way we chanted, and there was no English translation, which was really wonderful, because if you don't speak Korean, your eyes are glued to the page and if you have one moment of distraction . . . We know that from the Sino-Japanese recitation that we do: you can just lose it completely. The text just disappears before your very eyes, and you're floundering in space, which is also wonderful.

When Kaz brought me his first rendition or his first iteration of the translation, I remember I said to him, "Oh, this is going to cause some disturbance in how you're characterizing emptiness." But as we proceed in this course together, you'll begin to understand

why Kaz used a term which has to do with a state of heart and mind, which is particular to the realization of this sutra.

We thought it might be interesting to read a conventional translation. We've actually sung one translation or another of the Heart Sutra in this community since 1990, so that's twenty-five years. It's interesting. Twenty-five years we've been doing this recitation, not in the beginning in Sino-Japanese as well, but in the English version and in various English versions.

What is wonderful about the translation process with Kaz is that it's always a path of discovery—the sutra is always revealing itself—so the translation is always changing in response to the discovery process. And we're on that path, actually, in the experience that we're having here in this *zendo*.

So I'd like to invite us to read together out loud this version. He calls it a "common" English translation of the sutra. Let's just say the title together, and then we'll move through the recitation in a nonchanting way.

**GENERAL:** The Heart of the Perfection of Great Wisdom Sutra.

**ROSHI:** Let's just stop for a minute, actually, just letting this title—the Heart of the Perfection of Great Wisdom Sutra—and just for a moment, just a pause, a beat . . . What do you think this means—the Heart of the Perfection of Great Wisdom Sutra?

Now let's move into the text.

**GENERAL:** Avalokiteshvara Bodhisattva, doing deep *prajnaparamita* perceived the emptiness of all five conditions and was free of pain. Oh, Sariputra, form is no other than emptiness. Emptiness, no other than form. Form is precisely emptiness; emptiness, precisely form. Sensation, perception, reaction, and consciousness are also like this. Oh, Sariputra, all things are expressions of emptiness. Not born, not destroyed, not stained, not pure, neither waxing nor waning. Thus emptiness is not form, not sensation, nor perception, reaction, nor consciousness. No eyes, ear, nose, tongue, body, mind. No color, sound, smell, taste, touch, thing. No realm of sight, no realm of consciousness. No ignorance, no end to ignorance. No old age and death. No cessation of old age and death. No suffering, no pause or end to suffering. No path, no wisdom, and no gain. No gain. Thus bodhisattvas live this prajnaparamita with no hindrance of mind. No hindrance, therefore no fear. Far beyond all such delusion, nirvana is already here. All past,

present, and future buddhas live this prajnaparamita and attain supreme, perfect enlightenment. Therefore, know that prajnaparamita is the holy mantra, the luminous mantra, the supreme mantra, the incomparable mantra by which all suffering is cleared. This is no other than truth. Therefore, set forth the prajnaparamita mantra. Set forth this mantra and proclaim, "GATE GATE PARAGATE PARASAMGATE BODHI SVAHA."

**ROSHI:** That's familiar, I think, to many of us in the room. It's also familiar to, I'm sure, many of the people who are going to be tuning in to this particular course. I think it would be now interesting in the resonance of that particular translation for us to now recite the translation that Kaz, or Kaz and I, worked on many years ago.

**GENERAL:** The Sutra on the Heart of Realizing Wisdom beyond Wisdom.

**ROSHI:** Maybe just take a pause. You know, in a title, it essentializes, if you will, the text. Imagine that this title captures the transmission that this text is endeavoring to make. So let's proceed with the text now.

**GENERAL:** Avalokiteshvara, who helps all to awaken, moves in the deep course of realizing wisdom beyond wisdom, sees that all five streams of body, heart, and mind are without boundary, and frees all from anguish.

**ROSHI:** Could I ask us just to pause there? That's a really powerful opening. I wonder if we can go back and just start at the top and really, as we move through this text, allow the text itself to sink into our marrow.

**GENERAL:** Avalokiteshvara, who helps all to awaken, moves in the deep course of realizing wisdom beyond wisdom, sees that all five streams of body, heart, and mind are without boundary, and frees all from anguish. [Silence]

**ROSHI:** Kazu, are we to say who listens to the teachings of the Buddha? [*He shakes his head*] No, that's what I thought. As we move into the second portion, that which is in parentheses—"who

listens to the teachings of the Buddha"—refers to the Buddha's disciple, Sariputra, who was a great scholar. Don't recite that line; just go into "Form is not . . ."

GENERAL: Oh, Sariputra, form is not separate from boundlessness; boundlessness is not separate from form. Form is boundlessness; boundlessness is form. The same is true of feelings, perceptions, inclinations, and discernment. Oh, Sariputra, boundlessness is the nature of all things. It neither rises nor perishes, neither stains nor purifies, neither increases nor decreases. Boundlessness is not limited by form, nor by feelings, perceptions, inclinations, or discernment. It is free of the eyes, ears, nose, tongue, body, and mind; free of sight, sound, smell, taste, touch, and any object of mind; free of sensory realms, including the realm of the mind. It is free of ignorance and the end of ignorance. Boundlessness is free of old age and death and free from the end of old age and death. It is free of suffering, arising, cessation, and path, and free of wisdom and attainment. Being free of attainment, those who help all to awaken abide in the realization of wisdom beyond wisdom and live with an unhindered mind. Without ignorance, the mind has no fear. Free from confusion, those who lead all to liberation embody profound serenity. All those in the past, present, and future who realize wisdom beyond wisdom, manifest unsurpassable and thorough awakening, know that realizing wisdom beyond wisdom is no other than this wondrous mantra. Luminous, unequaled, and supreme, it relieves all suffering. It is genuine, not illusory. So set forth this mantra of realizing wisdom beyond wisdom. Set forth this mantra that says, "GATE GATE PARAGATE PARASAMGATE BODHI SVAHA."

ROSHI: Kaz crafted this particular translation for Buddhists as well as non-Buddhists. The idea in doing this work is not to make the philosophy of Buddhism, which is based on a view—a very deep and realizable view—inaccessible to others. The translation is, in fact, about making that view accessible to anyone. It's wonderful to sing it in Vietnamese, which I did for years, in Korean, which I did for years, in Sino-Japanese, which I did for years, but being able to actually rest in the language that I was born into and have that language be, in a certain way, a raft that carries me to a shoreline that is a view characterized by boundlessness—it's really, really powerful. And yet, the sutra itself, which is the embodiment, if you will, or the expression—more accurately—of the second turning of the wheel of the dharma, carries within it something which is really puzzling, which is the fundamental negation of the core teachings of the Buddha. Now that's powerful, isn't it?

What we want to do is to give you an assignment, and we're going to ask you to write down the first time you heard this sutra in a language that was accessible to you, not just in the beautiful Sino-Japanese, Vietnamese or Korean or Sanskrit, but in a tongue that is familiar to you. What was your experience when you heard it? What did it bring up for you? What did it teach you directly and indirectly? What puzzled you about it, if anything? What had you rejecting it/resisting it/saying, "Oh, that's just too strange—too many nos"?

I remember, "No eyes, no ears, no nose, no tongue, no body,"—oh my gosh, the list went on forever. I thought, "No chocolate, no bagel, no sunset, no sunrise"—no big deal. That's actually what I came to, but I didn't want to give you the answer. In fact, what we're asked to do, in part, is to recall what came up for us as we first encountered the sutra, but also to let the sutra sink into our sitting practice, knowing that we can, through Kaz (as we will in the next sessions), touch in to some of the scholarly aspects of the Heart Sutra. But also to see if we can come to a place where the Heart Sutra and our sitting practice are not separate.

One of the ways that we do this in a traditional practice situation is, in fact, not by studying the Heart Sutra conceptually but relating to it in a nonconceptual way, which is to chant the Heart Sutra. When we're chanting, we're not unpacking. We're actually using another part of our brain as a way to let the sutra awaken within us. I'd like to invite Joshin to come up as we'll be chanting the sutra quite a bit, till instead of chanting it, it's going to float, hopefully, in our midst.

Maybe, Joshin, you can give us some guidance on chanting practice.

JOSHIN: When we chant this in the mornings, we'll do it both in Sino-Japanese and in English, and it will be done on a straight tone but, as Roshi often says, with hara. It's got energy in it—a kind of a slight percussive, strong sound throughout the entire chant. You'll see that the Sino-Japanese is essentially a syllable at a time, so we'll flow right through this, with each syllable being equal all the way through. Then when we move into the English, it'll be very tempting to include all of the punctuation in your chanting; what we try to do is maintain a similar flow to the English, as we go through it—again, a kind of energetic movement to the whole chant. Shall we try?

ROSHI: Yeah.

JOSHIN: Shall we do it?

JOSHIN: The Sutra on the Heart of Realizing Wisdom beyond Wisdom.

GENERAL: Avalokiteshvara, who helps all to awaken, moves in the deep course of realizing wisdom beyond wisdom, sees that all five streams of body, heart, and mind are without boundary, and frees all from anguish. Oh, Sariputra, form is not separate from boundlessness; boundlessness is not separate from form. Form is boundlessness; boundlessness is form. The same is true of feelings, perceptions, inclinations, and discernment. Oh, Sariputra, boundlessness is the nature of all things. Boundlessness neither rises nor perishes, neither stains nor purifies, neither increases nor decreases. Boundlessness is not limited by form, nor by feelings, perceptions, inclinations, or discernment. It is free of the eyes, ears, nose, tongue, body, and mind; free of sight, sound, smell, taste, touch, and any object of mind; free of sensory realms, including the realm of the mind. It is free of ignorance and the end of ignorance. Boundlessness is free of old age and death and free from the end of old age and death. It is free of suffering, arising, cessation, and path, and free of wisdom and attainment. Being free of attainment, those who help all to awaken abide in the realization of wisdom beyond wisdom and live with an unhindered mind. Without ignorance, the mind has no fear. Free from confusion, those who lead all to awakening embody profound serenity. All those in the past, present, and future who realize wisdom beyond wisdom, manifest unsurpassable and thorough awakening, know that realizing wisdom beyond wisdom is no other than this wondrous mantra. Luminous, unequaled, and supreme, it relieves all suffering. It is genuine, not illusory. So set forth this mantra of realizing wisdom beyond wisdom. Set forth this mantra that says, "GATE GATE PARAGATE PARASAMGATE BODHI SVAHA."

**ROSHI:** That was wonderful. Thank you so much. The feeling in chanting—it's kind of interesting. In the traditional chant, the phonemes drop away, and it's like a tone vehicle that carries you. There's more distinctiveness when we chant in English. But the chant is really not so much about chanting from your head; it's chanting from the belly, and it has a quality of strength. The breath carries it; one opens the mouth, and it's done wholeheartedly.

Also it is not individualistic; in other words, it's not like an aria: the soprano is up there doing her thing. We're doing this kind of double listening. One is listening to our own experience

of phonating, of chanting, and then we're also listening to the whole community so that we're making a kind of singular field as we chant. I'd love to try it again, just if we could pitch it lower, if that's OK.

And you know, actually, we do it standing, and you'll see that . . . the difference between sit . . . I'm not going to ask you to stand. It's the end of the day, but you'll see the difference between sitting and doing the chant, kneeling as they do . . . In some temples they're actually kneeling up and chanting it, or standing, as we do in this temple, and it really . . . The kind of groundedness and strength changes depending on . . . If we were sitting, it's a little bit more tucked in. Standing is a little bit more vigorous.

One other thing I just want to mention is that in English, we in general chant in phrases, so that our breath, instead of inhaling at the end of our natural breath, we inhale where we're told to inhale in terms of where the phrase is. But in this particular form, we don't inhale all together. You inhale at the end of your breath, wherever that may be in the chant. So it has this continuous quality.

**JOSHIN:** The Sutra on the Heart of Realizing Wisdom Beyond Wisdom.

GENERAL: Avalokiteshvara, who helps all to awaken, moves in the deep course of realizing wisdom beyond wisdom, sees that all five streams of body, heart, and mind are without boundary, and frees all from anguish. Oh, Sariputra, form is not separate from boundlessness; boundlessness is not separate from form. Form is boundlessness; boundlessness is form. The same is true of feelings, perceptions, inclinations, and discernment. Oh, Sariputra, boundlessness is the nature of all things. It neither rises nor perishes, neither stains nor purifies, neither increases nor decreases. Boundlessness is not limited by form, nor by feelings, perceptions, inclinations, or discernment. It is free of the eyes, ears, nose, tongue, body, and mind; free of sight, sound, smell, taste, touch, and any object of mind; free of sensory realms, including the realm of mind. It is free of ignorance and the end of ignorance. Boundlessness is free of old age and death and free of the end of old age and death. It is free of suffering, arising, cessation, and path, and free of wisdom and attainment. Being free of attainment, those who help all to awaken abide in the realization of wisdom beyond wisdom and live with an unhindered mind. Without hindrance, the mind has no fear. Free from confusion, those who lead all to liberation embody profound serenity. All those in the past, present, and future who

realize wisdom beyond wisdom, manifest unsurpassable and thorough awakening, know that realizing wisdom beyond wisdom is no other than this wondrous mantra. Luminous, unequaled, and supreme, it relieves all suffering. It is genuine, not illusory. So set forth this mantra of realizing wisdom beyond wisdom. Set forth this mantra that says, "GATE GATE PARAGATE PARASAMGATE BODHI SVAHA."

**ROSHI:** Thank you, Joshin, so much.

I want to just make a few comments about my role in the translation process. Fortunately, Kaz is able to do the translations from Sanskrit and also from Chinese and Sino-Japanese. My role was to take the words that he was crafting out of the original text and find a way that that language could be chantable. Some chants are really kind of awkward in the mouth, so throughout the translation process, poor Kaz had to put up with me chanting, but that is the nature of our relationship. I would say, "That is so weird. I mean, that just doesn't work." And he'd say, "But that's what it means." And I'd say, "Well, it might mean that, but it's not going to mouth that." [Laughter, Kaz nodding]

Then we had a little translation assignment a few days ago, which was to take the last part of the dedication and to render that into accessible English. If we could go to what is called Awakening Together . . . This is a completely fresh-off-the-press translation. Let's see how it goes. Let's do it together.

**GENERAL:** All awakened ones throughout space and time, honored ones, great beings who help all to awaken, together may we realize wisdom beyond wisdom.

ROSHI: OK. Thank you.

We'd like to take just a few moments and to . . . As you've heard this new version, what comes up for you? What do you see? What feeling is present for you? What sticks, or what feels like a problem because you were used to something else for so long? Just a few lines from you.

Erik.

**STUDENT 1 (Erik):** It feels much more spacious, and I personally appreciate the move away from the lingo. It's a smaller club, and this feels like a bigger club.

**ROSHI:** Oh, that's wonderful. Erik is saying that this version of the Heart Sutra feels like it's a bigger club. That's very wonderful. Moving away from the lingo into something that's more accessible to people. Thank you so much, Erik. [Bows]

MJ, where are you? [Laughter] Yeah, MJ, I'm just interested in what your perspective is.

**STUDENT 2 (MJ):** It makes sense. The first . . . the common . . . what was the common English version, I haven't . . . I'm a sort of baby Buddha, so it sort of lost me in the middle. I became very conceptual, trying to figure out what it was. This one seems to hit to the heart faster.

**ROSHI:** OK. Wonderful, MJ. Wonderful.

Marilyn.

STUDENT 3 (Marilyn): I like the new one a lot better in that it offers more space for creativity with it.

**ROSHI:** Uh-huh. OK, I like that: "space for creativity." Wonderful.

STUDENT 4 (John): I was very surprised when first coming here to encounter "boundlessness" as a translation of shunyata. It seemed to me—and still seems to me—in a way that it's less cutting, cutting of a kind of limited perspective that comes, which felt to be part of my process. But I have to say, as time goes on, the way other people talk about boundlessness as expressing something further down the line, it makes sense to me.

**ROSHI:** Barbara.

STUDENT 5 (Barbara): Well, it's rather a reaction to what John's saying. I think that not only is boundlessness a wonderful choice, but in attempting to be more accessible to people, the teachings, which is the purpose of this . . . "Free of sight, sound, ears, nose" is such a positive message within this teaching, every bit as positive as boundlessness. So instead of it being "no this, no that," you know, neti neti—that whole concept—it's an expansive way of looking at the teachings. I think it succeeds wonderfully, not only as boundless but when you constantly use the word *free*. So thank you for that.

**ROSHI:** And he is pretty free of old age. [Laughter]

**KAZ:** So we are looking for complaints. [Laughter]

**ROSHI:** I would like to thank Barbara for that comment. I feel that Kaz's characterization that's free of negativity is very interesting, in a cultural context, where *no* is such a prevalent response to what is. This is a way that we can express a view that is free. Yeah, wonderful, Barbara.

**STUDENT 1:** I suppose something that just catches me in both translations is the second-to-last stanza, when it talks about the mantra being "luminous, unequaled, and supreme." I live in terms of Stephen Batchelor—whenever we start talking about spiritual superlatives it, in my experience, opens the door for disagreement and contention. And so I love... I love the words "genuine" and "not illusory," but I think the things that catch me—and this is true in both translations—is the "unequaled" and "supreme." Yeah.

**ROSHI:** Good point, Erik, that there's something . . . We've been doing a little comparative process here: "I like this version better than that," or "I don't like that as much as this." So that's kind of an interesting process, antithetical to the spirit of the sutra. But no matter—this is the spirit of debate and Western critique. So I think your point is really well taken.

**KAZ:** I think also it's important because those who are participating in the online course are much more used to the common translations, so we should be really open to their doubt and some negative reactions. So I think it's a good process to have a dialogue.

**ROSHI:** And I'm so grateful that you don't agree with that languaging in the spirit of democracy. Yes, Marilyn?

**STUDENT 3 (Marilyn):** Also, in the spirit of how positive it is, I don't . . . I'm not hindered by the negative messages. Before, I didn't chant it that much. But this has such a payoff—that when you're free of attainment, the mind is unhindered, and without hindrance, the mind has no fear,

so you're given the path right there. Why go down this path at all? That speaks to everybody, to

live a life without . . . because unhindered and without fear.

ROSHI: Yeah, Marilyn's point, I think, is really important. When we're free of hindrances, fear

disappears, and the path of freedom is the path that we're actualizing in the experience of

practice. Thank you, Marilyn.

KAZ: Also, I'd like to say that this: our translation is not meant replace the existing, common

version. We are trying to make just one version that could be helpful to some people, and also

maybe provoke some thinking to those who have been, and will be, chanting the common

versions.

ROSHI: Thanks, Kaz.

Michelle?

STUDENT 6 (Michelle): Yes, I think that when you first come to the sutra, especially, as I did,

quite a long time ago, there's a way that the wording and what it's pointing to is so foreign, and

unknown, that you can kind of go to sleep a little bit with it. And the more you chant it over

time, you think, "Oh yes, those are words and sentiments." But the way this translation is, it

forces you to wake up a bit, because the words are more familiar; you can have some

understanding, and it sort of piques that waking-up process—that paying-attention process.

**ROSHI:** Oh, wonderful. Wake up. Good. What's your name?

**STUDENT 7 (Miranda):** Miranda.

ROSHI: Hi, Miranda.

STUDENT 7: I'm pretty new at Buddhism, and when I came across the word emptiness, for me it

seemed really dry and almost painful. I was taking this in—trying to take it in—going, "This is

really difficult." Then when I heard the translation of boundlessness, all of a sudden I just felt like

12

it opened me up, because I could . . . I'm really a visual person, and I could just . . . I got the Heart Sutra when I heard your translation, because I'm so new at it. It's very, very helpful.

**ROSHI:** Wonderful. This is . . . [*inaudible*] you describe your experience. It is the spirit that drove us into this particular translation, and I think Erik also mentioned it: how do we practice greater inclusivity in not only this practice of Buddhism but in all of our life? The effect of resistance is so draining—so deeply debilitating—and the view of the Heart Sutra is one of freedom, of boundlessness. Wonderful.

We're coming to the end of this session, just having touched into the common translation and then the not-so-common translation. As I requested of you earlier, if you would just recall your first encounter with the Heart Sutra and what came up for you. Also to understand . . .

As Kaz began his talk tonight, he spoke of the Heart Sutra as an "enigma," and the view is it's very interesting to academically unpack, but it's another thing to actually let the sutra soak into your body and to see if it can, through time, evoke the quality of mind which is free of resistance, because resistance is not other than fear. And to bring into what Erik so beautifully said, to practice radical inclusivity. Yeah.

So we complete our sessions always at Upaya with chanting the Four Vows and the Night Chant.

Joshin, if you would help us with that. [Gong]

**GENERAL:** Creations are numberless; I vow to free them. Delusions are inexhaustible; I vow to transform them. Reality is boundless; I vow to perceive it. The awakened way is unsurpassable; I vow to embody it. Creations are numberless; I vow to free them. Delusions are inexhaustible; I vow to transform them. Reality is boundless; I vow to perceive it. The awakened way is unsurpassable; I vow to embody it. Creations are numberless; I vow to free them. Delusions are inexhaustible; I vow to transform them. Reality is boundless; I vow to perceive it. The awakened way is unsurpassable; I vow to embody it.

**JOSHIN:** Let me respectfully remind you life and death are of supreme importance. Time passes swiftly, and opportunity is lost. Let us awaken, awaken, take heed. Do not squander your life.