THE YESHIVA PIRCHEI SHOSHANIM SHULCHAN ARUCH LEARNING PROJECT

# Hilchos Shabbos Volume One Lesson Three



#### Revised and edited by: Rabbi Leibie Landsman

# Food Burning on the Stove



Siman 253:3-5

Food atop an empty pot
Pouring water into food on the fire
Part I

#### Siman 253 Se'if 3

3 If one rises early (on Shabbos morning) and finds that the food in his pot is beginning to burn, if he is concerned that it might burn, he may remove it, place a used empty pot on the mouth of the Kirah, and then put the pot containing the food atop the empty pot. One should be careful not to place the pot (containing the food) on the ground and it should be boiling hot. (It has already been stated that it is customary to be lenient (and permit returning a pot to a stove) even where it has been placed on the ground).

#### Siman 253 Se'if 4

4 One should protest against those whose practice it is to wrap up a kettle of hot water while still day (on Erev Shabbos), and then pour it into a pot of food on Shabbos when the food begins to dry out (see below Siman 318).

#### Siman 253 Se'if 5

5 On Shabbos, it is permissible to place onto a pot of hot water, a dish of food that is already fully cooked such as Panades¹ or the like, in order to warm it, since he is not he is not cooking in a usual manner. However it is definitely forbidden to place (food) under cloths that cover a water kettle.

<u>RAMA</u> similarly it is forbidden to place (food) on a Kirah even if it is Gerufa and Ketuma,<sup>2</sup> as the sages only permitted Chazora<sup>3</sup> (but not placing a pot for the first time), as has been explained above.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> A sort of knish, borekas - without any liquid

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The coals have been raked or covered with ashes

Some (authorities) permit placing (a pot of food) into a Tanur used for baking on Erev Shabbos, when no food was left warming in it (it was merely used for baking on Erev Shabbos), only a small amount of heat remains and there need be no concern that this will cause it (the pot) to be cooked - provided (the food) has not cooled completely. Some, however, are stringent here, and (hold that) if the heat of the Tanur is so intense that it is of Yad soledes bo, it is forbidden. See below Siman 318. One may not tell an Aino Yehudi 5 to do anything that is forbidden to do himself. It is therefore forbidden to tell an Aino Yehudi to heat up the pot (of food) that has cooled. If one does so, it is assur to eat it even cold. However, if the food has not cooled below the temperature at which it is edible, it may be eaten if the non-Iew heats it up. For this reason it is common practice to have non-Iews remove pots of food from ovens in which they have been stored to retain their heat and place them next to or on top of a heating stove, and then have the (non-[evish) maidservant light the stove, whereupon the food will become boiling hot once again. However it is forbidden to do this through a Jew. If, however, the pots are still hot they may be placed next to the heating stove. The reason is that, as has been explained, our ovens have a status of a Kirah, and placing it next to a Kirah, which is not Garuf Ve'katum, has the same law as placing directly on top of it when it is Garuf Ve'katum (which is muter). It has already been stated that the customary practice is to be lenient (and permit) to do Chazora even if the pot has been placed on the ground. Similarly, placing (a pot) next to an oven, which is not Garuf Ve'katum (is muter) if the food is still hot and fully cooked. It is a widespread, accepted practice to permit this. See below Siman 318.

#### SIMAN 253:3

# **Placing Food onto a Pot**

This se'if is based on the laws of *Chazora* in se'if 2. The innovation of this se'if is that placing an empty pot on top of an uncovered *Kirah*, gives the *Kirah* a status of *Gerufa* and *Ketuma*, to allow *Chazora* on Shabbos.

The remainder of the se'if follows the usual guidelines for Chazora.

According to the *Mechaber*, once the *Kirah* is covered with a pot one may do *Chazora* as long as the pot of food was not placed on the ground, the food is fully cooked and the food remains at *Yad soledes.*<sup>6</sup> The *Mishnah Berura 83* says that our *Minhag* is to be lenient, as long as the food is still warm, it may be returned to the covered *Kirah*, even though it is not *Yad soledes bo*.

The Rama mentions a custom that one may return food to the Blech even if it was placed onto the floor. This custom is based on the Ran who holds that the laws of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Returning a pot to a stove

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Literally meaning the hand retracts from the heat – too hot to touch, the degree where food begins to cook.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Aino Yehudi – a non-Jew

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> As mentioned often before – the temperature at which food is considered boiling

Chazora only apply only to food removed before Shabbos and returned on Shabbos.

According to applied *Halacha* we are *machmir* and only allow *Chazora* when the food was not placed onto the ground on Shabbos (as long as all the other conditions mentioned in *se'if 2* are met).

#### The Blech Fell Off

In this *se'if* we learn that one is permitted even to place a *Blech* onto open flames on Shabbos; surely then if the *Blech* falls off, it may be also be returned to the fire.

Some "stovetop covers" are made from thin metal and when placed onto a fire they turn red hot. Such a *Bleth* or cover may not be placed onto the fire because it involves the *Melacha* of מבעיר making a fire.

For advanced study: The Chazon Ish has a concern with the issue of annealing a חצי שיעור. This issue can be found in the Shemiras Shabbos Ke'hilchasa 1:18 footnote 60. Ray Shlomo Zalman Auerbach argues there with the Chazon Ish.

Another important topic regards placing food *lechatchila*<sup>10</sup> on top of another pot on Shabbos. This will be discussed in *se'if 5*.

#### SIMAN 253:4

# **Pouring Water**

The *Nimukei Yosefi* in *Bava Basra 10a* quotes *Rabbeinu Yona* who says that people who pour water, which was stored in a kettle before Shabbos into food that is drying out, are violating the Shabbos when the food is *Yad soledes* and the water is not. By reheating the cooled water to more than *Yad soledes*, one is doing *Bishul.*<sup>12</sup>

The problem here happened because the water was just wrapped up and lost its heat. If, however, the water was also on a *Blech* or hotplate – retaining the same heat as the food, there would be no problem as both pots would be above *Yad soledes* and one may pour the water into the pot.

8 Stringent

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> See M"B 67

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> A metal sheet used to cover the flames

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> For the first time, not only through *Chazora* 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Can be found at the back of the Gemora around the Rif

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Cooking – one of the 39 Melachos of Shabbos. Reheating be'issur will be discussed in greater detail in Siman 318

Rabbeinu Yona in his sefer Aliyos de Rabbeinu Yona 13 (Bava Basra 19a) presents a different reason for the above prohibition. He states that even if both foods (the water and food) are Yad soledes, nevertheless according to an opinion in the Talmud Yerushalmi "Irui lav ke"Keli Rishon" i.e. the liquid poured from a Keli Rishon (the pot on the fire) does not retain the status of that Keli Rishon once poured out of the Keli Rishon. Therefore, it is assur to mix it into the food in the pot on the fire because it gets cooked again.

According to this reason, not only is it *assur* to pour water stored in a flask etc. from before Shabbos into the pot of food, but it is even *assur* to take water that is cooking on the fire and pour it into the food.

#### SIMAN 253:4 CONTINUED

# **Pouring Hot Water into a Pot**

#### **According to the Rama**

The Magen Avraham 32 says that in accordance with our Minhag to allow Chazora of food that is still warm, even water that is less than Yad soledes may be poured into a hot pot of food. The Mishnah Berura 84 supports this Halacha.

#### Mechaber

The *Mechaber* holds, according to some opinions, once the food or liquid is in a *Keli Sheini*, it loses its status of a cooked food and when reheated in a *Keli Rishon* <sup>14</sup> it is cooking again. Therefore, to pour the water from the thermos flask – a *Keli Sheini*, into the pot of food – a *Keli Rishon*, the water cooks, and it is forbidden to do so.

#### Rama

The *Rama* is not bothered by the fact that the water is in a *Keli Sheini* and then poured into a *Keli Rishon*, because as long as the water is still warm it is not considered cooking. In this case, all the other conditions of *Chazora* do not have to be met, because the water is not being placed into a pot on the fire, rather into a *Keli Rishon* off the fire.

# There are 5 situations according to the <u>Rama</u> where his leniency can be applied

#### Case #1

When pouring warm water stored<sup>15</sup> before Shabbos, in the original kettle that it was cooked in – i.e., Keli Rishon - into a pot of food on the stove.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Rabbeinu Yona was also quoted by the Chidushei HaRan Shabbos 47b and other Meforshim.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> The original pot where the food was cooked.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Stored – refers to hot water wrapped in a container to retain its heat. In general, it is *assur* to move something from a state of *Hatmana* to a *Kirah* or the other way - M"B 62. Our discussion is in a very limited scenario.

- A. The water was removed from the fire with the **intention of being returned** to the fire (albeit to another pot).
- B. It was continually held in one's hand., or at least it must not have been placed on the floor. *Bedi'eved* even if the water was put onto the floor, one may be *lenient* to do *Chazora* as long as all the other conditions of *Chazora* were met.
- C. It must still be hot or at least warm.
- D. The water was fully cooked.
- **E.** The fire must be covered with a *Blech* (i.e. *Garuf Ve'katum*).

#### Case #2

When pouring water directly from a kettle that is on the fire into a pot of food that is on the stove.

Even if the water is not *Yad soledes bo*, since it is was on the fire and it is still warm, it is *muter* to pour the water from the kettle into the food.

Nevertheless, one must take care that the spout of the kettle or urn is not held too close to the pot of food, because the steam rising from the usually "meaty" *Cholent*, can make the kettle meaty.

Also, if it comes down into the pot of food on the fire with a force it is an issue of *Meigis* – stirring, which we are *machmir* not to do, like the opinion of the *Kolbo* in *Siman* 318:18

#### **Using a Cup or Ladle**

In the *Shemiras Shabbos Ke'hilchasa*, <sup>16</sup> Rav *Shlomo Zalman Auerbach zt''l* is quoted that it is *muter* to use a cup or ladle to transfer the water from the urn to the pot of food.

His son, *HaRav* Shmuel Auerbach *shlit"a*,<sup>17</sup> says the reason it is *muter* to use a cup is because the cup acts like a bridge and is not considered as being placed into another vessel. He thereby avoids the problem of *Pina mi'meicham le'meicham*.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> SS"K chapter 1 footnote 44 and the 3<sup>rd</sup> volume (תיקונים ומילואים) 1<sup>st</sup> chapter annotation 44. The SS"K (two volumes) was written by Rav Neuvirth shlit"a and it includes many Halachos from Rav Shlomo Zalman Auerhach xt". Prior to his passing he reviewed everything quoted in his name and his new annotations were compiled into the "3<sup>rd</sup>" volume, the תיקונים ומילואים.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> He wrote about this topic in his approbation to sefer Megillas Sefer written by one of his disciples.

#### Case #3

When pouring water from a thermos flask – *Keli Sheini* - into a pot of food on the stove.

In order to understand this case well, we must introduce a new concept, as follows:

#### Pina Mi'meicham Le'meicham<sup>18</sup>

The *Gemora* in *Shabbos 38b*, where it discusses different laws of *Chazora*, asks what would be the law if one removed a pot of food from the fire, transferred the food to another pot, and wishes to return the *new* pot of food to the fire.

Rashi<sup>19</sup> explains the point of doubt to be that we know that *Chazora* is allowed, not putting the food on Shabbos onto the fire for the first time.

Therefore, when one returns the same pot of food to the fire (where all the conditions of *Chazora* are met) it is viewed as *Chazora*. But when one transfers the food to another pot and places the *new* pot with the *old* food onto the fire, it looks like he's placing it there for the first time. The *Gemora* leaves this question unanswered.

#### What is the Halacha in this Matter?

The Magen Avraham 20 says that the Rama, who holds that one of the conditions of Chazora is that the food must be continually held in one's hand, prohibits doing Chazora if the food was transferred to another pot.

The Shulchan Aruch HaRav 14 also holds like the Magen Avraham and forbids Chazora if the food was transferred to another pot.

However, the *Mishnah Berura* in *Sha'ar HaTziyun 47* says that one can be *meikel* - lenient and do *Chazora* even if the food was transferred to another pot.

In Case #3 the water was stored in a thermos flask, which is a new pot, not the utensil the water was heated in. Therefore, if one wants to add water from the thermos into the pot of food that is on the stove, the issue of *Pina mi'meicham le'meicham* exists.

#### Therefore:

According to the *Magen Avraham* and the *Shulchan Aruch HaRav*, it is forbidden to add the water to the pot of food, as that water comes from a *new* pot, and is viewed as placing for the first time, not *Chazora*.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Meaning – food emptied or poured from one pot to another

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Rashi beginning with the word: Pinan etc.

#### However,

Even according to the M"B, who is meikel in the law of Pina mi'meicham le'meicham, it is assur, because placing the water in a flask is worse than placing the food onto the floor – as it is a completely eliminating the food from the fire. Even if one has intention to return it to the fire, it will not help  $(Rav\ Shlomo\ Zalman\ Auerbach^{20})$ .

#### Case #4

When pouring boiling water from a kettle that is on the fire, into a plate that has food and liquid in it.

We will learn be"H in Siman 318 that there is no issur to reheat cold cooked dry food. However, there is an issur to reheat cold cooked liquids:

- 1) According to the *Mechaber* if cooled below *Yad soledes*
- 2) According the Rama if no longer warm

WHEN ONE POURS BOILING WATER FROM THE KETTLE THAT IS ON THE FIRE ONTO COLD LIQUIDS OR FOODS WHICH CONTAIN LIQUIDS AND ARE IN A PLATE OR BOWL, THEN...

#### **ACCORDING TO THE MECHABER...**

If the liquids are less than *Yad soledes*, it is forbidden, because the boiling water reheats the liquid.

#### ACCORDING TO THE RAMA...

If the liquids are still warm, it is *muter*. Since the liquids are still warm from its *Bishul* – cooking, no new cooking takes place since the effect of the first *Bishul* is still present. However, once they have cooled, it is forbidden, because the boiling water cooks the liquids.

However, the *Mishnah Berura 84* quotes the *Magen Avraham 32* saying that it is preferable to use a ladle to pour the water onto the liquid that is in the plate, rather than pouring directly onto it. By using a ladle, the food or liquid in the ladle (in some cases<sup>21</sup>) becomes a *Keli Sheini* and when poured onto the liquid in the plate, it does not cook it.<sup>22</sup>

<sup>20</sup> פניני המאור ח"ג מב-א.

\_\_\_\_\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> If the ladle is not left inside the pot where the ladle will get very hot and be considered like a *Keli Rishon* – see *M"B 318 s"k 43* 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> The reason is that *Irui keli sheini ke'keli shlishi* – that pouring from a second vessel has the status of the third vessel, which does not cook.

The *Mishnah Berura* adds that if the liquid in the plate has cooled down, a ladle must be used according to all opinions.

#### Case #5

When pouring water from a thermos flask into a pot of food that was removed from the fire.

Machlokes Mechaber and Rama - Pouring into a pot off the fire

The water in the thermos flask is considered a Keli Sheini.<sup>23</sup>

#### **Pouring Water into a Pot on the Stove**

The *Beis Yosef* cites a *Kol bo* saying that there is an issue of *Hagasah*<sup>24</sup> – stirring or mixing, when pouring the water into the pot. It is noteworthy to mention that *Rav Shlomo Zalman Auerbach* wrote<sup>25</sup> that if one pours the water gently into the pot, there should be no problem of *Meigis* – stirring, and this our *Minhag*.

#### **Covering the Pot on the Stove**

Covering the pot of fully cooked food after adding the water, in certain instances, can have the same effect as *Meigis* because it quickens the cooking process.

HaRav Moshe Sternbuch shlit"a (Teshuvos Ve'hanhogos 1-27) and other Poskim are Meikel regarding covering the pot. HaRav Ezriel Auerbach also agrees that it is Muter to cover the pot.

*Iggros Moshe (Vol. 4, 74-10)* maintains that one should leave the lid semi-closed and then add water. He says that if one totally uncovered the pot, one should be *machmir* not to cover it again on the stove.

The Sefer Shemiras Shabbos Ke'hilchasa says<sup>26</sup> that one *lechatchila* should not cover the pot when it is on the fire even when the food is fully cooked. It should be lifted, covered and returned to the fire. However, if the fire is not covered and due to that he will not be able to return the pot to the stove, one can rely upon the lenient opinion and cover the food when on the stove.<sup>27</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Second vessel. Food or liquid poured from the cooking pot into another vessel, bowl, plate etc.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> The problem is that by stirring the food one quickens the cooking process, and even if the food is fully cooked, the *Kolbo* was *machmir* and said food should not be stirred. The debate is whether pouring has the effect of stirring or only whether one might come to stir.

<sup>25</sup> מיקונים ומילואים פ"א הערה מב

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> SS"K chapter 1 footnote 94

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> This matter will be discussed later in Siman 318

# Placing One Pot onto Another

#### Part I

#### SIMAN 253:5

#### TOPICS IN THIS SEIF

- 1. Placing pots on top of other pots
- 2. If an Aino Yehudi warmed food for a Jew
- 3. Warming food on a heating stove

The Ran in Shabbos 19a<sup>28</sup> teaches us that it is muter to place a cold pot of cooked dry food on top of another pot that is on the fire, even without adhering to any of the laws of Chazora. This pertains even to foods taken from the refrigerator.

However, this does not apply to liquids. We will learn in *Siman 318*, in detail, that soups or foods with gravy are *assur* to reheat above *Yad soledes* except when the laws of *Chazora* are kept.

This *Mechaber* example of a *Panades* is an example of a food that may be reheated since it is like a meat knish which doesn't have any liquid gravy.<sup>29</sup>

The reason why the usual conditions of *Chazora* do not apply here is because this is not the usual manner of cooking we don't perceive him as cooking something from anew (See M" $\mathcal{A}$  33).

#### CONTRADICTION

Many *Poskim* point out that se'if 3 and se'if 5 seem to contradict each other.

In *se'if 3* the *Mechaber* says that if the food is drying out, one may take a dry empty pot, place it on the fire and then place the pot of food on top of it, emphasizing that the pot must not be placed on the floor.

In se'if 5 it says that one may take a pot of food that was cooked on *Erev* Shabbos and place it on top of a pot of food that is presently cooking on the fire, even though the *new* pot is cold or was not previously on the fire.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> In the Rif's numbering

 $<sup>^{29}\,</sup>M$  B  $^{86}$ 

#### THREE WAYS TO RESOLVE CONTRADICTION

#### **Magen Avraham**

The Magen Avraham in Siman 318:26 explains the Mechaber that se'if 3 refers to soups or foods with liquid, and it is muter to place it onto another pot because it was already on the fire, and he is doing Chazora.<sup>30</sup>

If it was not on the fire until now, it is *assur* to place it onto another pot even if the liquid is warm or even hot. *Se'if 5* that allows it to be placed onto the pot even when it wasn't on a fire refers to dry foods that may be placed on top of other pots even if they are cold.<sup>31</sup>

Accordingly, it is *muter* to place any type of dry food onto pots that are on the stove.

The M"A himself disagrees with the Mechaber's psak and paskens that it is muter to place warm liquids onto other pots on the fire even when they have not been on the fire until now.

#### Dagul Me'revava 32

The Dagul Me'revava draws on the Ran to answer this contradiction.

The above-mentioned Ran says that food such as Pandas' may be placed directly on a Kirah on Shabbos (as long as it is Mitztamek ve'ra lo³³) because everyone can see that the intention is to reheat the Panades and not to cook it, since the common cooking device for Panades is inside an oven, not on top of a stove.

Therefore, the *Dagul Me'revava* concludes that in *se'if 5* we are referring particularly to foods such as *Panades*, which according to the *Ran* may be placed directly onto a stove. However, in *se'if 3* the *Mechaber* refers to foods that are commonly cooked *on top* of a stove. Those types of foods may only be *returned* to the fire, not placed there for the first time since otherwise it gives the impression he maybe cooking it for the first time.

Accordingly it is *assur* to place onto pots that are on the stove, even dry foods, if they are the type which commonly cooked *on top* of a stove.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> It is irrelevant whether the pot that is on the fire has food in it or not

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> This explanation of the M"A is according to the understanding of the Tosefos Shabbos

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> The famous Rav Yechezkel Landau zt"l of Prague, author of the Noda Be'Yehuda. The Dagul Me'revava's annotations can be found in the margin of our edition of the Shulchan Aruch.

<sup>33</sup> Hardening to its detriment

#### **Pri Megadim**

The *Pri Megadim* offers a more simple and straightforward solution. *se'if* 5 refers to placing a pot onto a **pot that has food inside it** which is on the fire. Since placing a pot of food on top of another pot with food inside is not the common method of cooking, there is no cause for concern that it looks like he's cooking food. *se'if* 3 refers to placing an empty pot onto the flame to cover it. This looks more like the common manner of cooking since sometimes people cover a fire to cook food on the cover, giving the impression that he may be cooking on Shabbos.

The *Chazon Ish*<sup>34</sup> explains the *Pri Megadim* as follows: when the bottom utensil is full, it absorbs the primary heat and the pot above is not considered on the fire, but when the bottom utensil is empty, the heat rises almost entirely to the full pot, and is considered as being directly on the fire.

The *Bi'ur Halacha* <sup>35</sup> commends the *Pri Megadim* solution and goes on to explain why he prefers the *Pri Megadim's* solution over the solution of the *Dagul Me'revava*. Since the *Mechaber* disagrees with this *Ran*, it's obvious that he would not use the *Ran* as the basis to allow putting food directly on the stove. Rather there must be a different explanation to explain the contradiction between the two *se'ifim*.

According to the *Pri Megadim*, one may put any dry food onto another pot of food that is on the fire, not only *Panades* oven-baked types. They must however be dry and fully cooked foods.

#### Halacha Le'ma'aseh

We follow the *psak* of the *Bi'ur Halacha*. Therefore one may put any dry, fully cooked food on top of another pot of food that is on the fire, even cold from the refrigerator.

#### Placing previously cooked food onto an Inverted Pot over a Blech

QUESTION

If one doesn't have a pot of food presently cooking on the fire, may he place an empty pot or tin upside down over the *Blech* or hotplate and place a dry, cold pot of food on top? <sup>36</sup>

<sup>34</sup> Simon 37 at the end of se'if 9

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> In se'if 3 opening with the words: ויזהר שלא.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> E.g. Kugel, pie or knish

#### ANSWER

We just mentioned that according to the *Pri Megadim*, an empty pot placed onto a fire makes the stove *Garuf Ve'katum*, and one may only **return** food (do *Chazora*) to the stove but not place cold food there. Then why should placing an empty inverted pot on the *Blech* make it any better?

An argument can be made to justify using an inverted pot over a *Blech*. The difference is that placing a cold pot of food onto a pot of food cooking on the fire is *muter* because it is not the usual way of cooking, so it's perceived that he is just warming previously cooked food and not cooking anew. So too, by inverting an empty pot on a *Blech* or hotplate and using the top warm cold food is also not the usual way of cooking. Therefore, it too is perceived as warming and not cooking.

This is the psak of Rav S. Z. Auerbach – See Shemiras Shabbos Ke'hilchasa (Vol. 3 fn. 112), and HaRav Shmuel HaLevi Vozner (Vol. 1 Siman 91). It is important to note that not all Poskim agree to this leniency. One should consult with a Rav before using this leniency.

# **Summary**

- A *Blech* may be placed on a fire even on Shabbos. It can also be replaced in the event that it falls off.
- According to the *Mishnah Berura*, one is allowed to transfer the contents from one pot into another provided the conditions of *Chazora* are met. Therefore, it is *muter* to pour hot water from a kettle (*Keli Rishon*) into Cholent that is burning on the stove if those conditions are met. One may even use a cup as a medium.
- The water should be poured gently to avoid issues of *Hagasah*. However, if the water is coming from a thermos (*Keli Sheini*) it is forbidden because of *Pina mi'meicham le'meicham*.
- According to the Rama, liquids that were cooked may be reheated as long as they have not cooled completely. It would follow that one may pour hot water directly from a Keli Rishon onto warm liquids. Nevertheless, the M"B advises to be stringent and to use a ladle. When pouring onto cool liquids one must use a ladle according to all opinions.
- Some *Poskim* hold that covering a pot that is on the stove is forbidden because it is tantamount to *Hagasah*. Other *Poskim* permit it (this is

- only true when the food is fully cooked). *Lechatchila* one should do so when the food is off the fire.
- One may reheat food that is cold, dry and fully cooked on top of a pot of food that is on a fire. On top of an empty pot one needs the conditions of *Chazora*

# **Review Questions**

- 1. May one return a Blech to the fire that fell off or moved out of place?
- 2. What are the problems of pouring water into a pot of food that is on the fire?
- 3. All the cases mentioned in the *shiur* are according to the *Rama*, why can they not be according to the *Mechaber?*
- 4. May one pour water from one pot on the fire to another (according to the Rama)?
- 5. When food is transferred to another pot, is it more reason to permit *Chazora* or less reason?
- 6. What is the Halacha in a case of Pina mi'meicham le'meicham, may one do Chazora?
- 7. May one pour soup from the pot onto cooked rice, cold gravy, a piece of chicken?
- 8. May one pour a cold, cooked liquid into a *Keli Rishon* that is not on the fire (return cold soup to the hot pot of soup)?
- 9. If the soup in a plate is *Yad soledes bo* may it be returned to the pot of soup off the fire?
- 10. What type of pots may be placed above a pot on the fire?
- 11. Why is the placing on top of another pot better than placing directly onto a Blech?
- 12. What is the apparent contradiction between se'if 3 and se'if 5?
- 13. How is this contradiction resolved?
- 14. Is one permitted to place a pot of food (from the refrigerator) directly onto the *Blech* or hotplate?
- 15. How is one to heat food on Shabbos day?

### **Review Answers**

- 1. Yes, perfectly permissible. One must take care though that it is not made of a substance that will turn red hot when in contact with fire.
- 2. Two main problems. The stored water may have cooled down and when returned to the fire one is re-cooking the water. The other problem is that when poured from a *Keli Rishon* it loses its cooked status and is re-cooked when in the pot on the fire. There is another problem mentioned in *Siman 318* of *Meigis* stirring the contents.
- 3. The *Mechaber* holds that one may not pour stored water into a pot. R' *Yona* brings the opinion of the *Yerushalmi* that even pouring from water that is on the fire into another pot that is on the fire is a problem of *Bishul* because the water cools down upon leaving the pot. There are different views as to the opinion of the *Mechaber* (whether he rules like R' Yona) and therefore it is not simple that according to the *Mechaber* one may pour from a pot on the fire.
- 4. Yes one may, provided that the laws of *Chazora* are met, which in this case would mean that the fire is covered, the water is fully cooked and *lechatchila* the pot of water was not put down.
- 5. It is less reason to permit it because it does not look as if one is returning food to the fire, as this pot was not there previously.
- 6. The Magen Avraham and the Shulchan Aruch HaRav prohibit it; it appears from the Sha'ar Ha'Tziyun to be permitted.
- 7. Pouring from a hot soup in a *Keli Rishon* is equivalent to cooking. Therefore one may pour hot soup onto dry cooked rice and a cold piece of chicken because they are fully cooked and dry. One may not pour it onto cold gravy because gravy is a liquid and it re-cooks it.
- 8. Once the liquid has cooled down it may not be returned to a *Keli Rishon* that is *Yad soledes bo* even if it is not on the fire. If it is still warm, it may be returned according to the *Rama* but not according to the *Mechaber*.
- 9. According to the *Rama*, it may, as above. According to the *Mechaber* there are some opinions that one may not, because once outside a *Keli*

Rishon it loses its cooked status and when placing it inside the pot it cooks again.

- 10. Only food that is fully cooked and solids. Liquids may not be placed on top of a pot if it can reach *Yad soledes bo*. This is based on *Siman 318*.
- 11. Placing on top of another pot is not the regular cooking method and therefore it acts as a reminder not to stoke the coals or raise the fire.
- 12. In *se'if 3* it says that one must not place the pot onto the floor before placing it above another pot on the fire, and in se'if 5 it says that one may place a pot of food on top of another pot without stipulations.
- 13. There are several solutions. The M"A differentiates between liquids and solids. The Dagul Me'revava differentiates between foods cooked on a stove and foods cooked in an oven, based on the Ran. The PM"G differentiates between placing above a pot with food and an empty pot. The Bi'ur Halacha cites the PM"G.
- 14. We see from the *PM*"G that it is forbidden, if we take for granted that our hotplates are equivalent to a *Blech*. (There are *Poskim* who say that a hotplate is better than a *Blech* and one may place food directly onto it provided that there is no problem of *Bishul*. We will send an appendix addressing this issue).
- 15. Food that is not subject to the constraints of *Bishul* such as fully cooked dry foods may be placed onto a pot of food that is on the fire or on top of a water urn. Another option, according to some *Poskim*, is to place an upside baking tin onto the *Blech* or hotplate and place fully cooked solids on top of that.